

CMS

Law . Tax

CMS Cameron McKenna LLP

Mitre House  
160 Aldersgate Street  
London EC1A 4DD

DX 135316 BARBICAN 2

T  GRO

F  GRO

[www.cms-cmck.com](http://www.cms-cmck.com)

Direct  GRO

E [susan.bartley@cms-cmck.com](mailto:susan.bartley@cms-cmck.com)  GRO

9 December 2014

By Fax - 020 8008 2210

BBC Programme Legal Advice  
British Broadcasting Corporation  
Room WC 2251  
White City  
London  
W12 7TS

**URGENT  
NOT FOR BROADCAST**

Your ref  
Our ref SCB/SCB/MIT/111850.00038

Dear Sirs

**The One Show – Post Office Limited**

We act for Post Office Limited and have been consulted in connection with a proposed broadcast for the One Show which we understand is due to be broadcast on Wednesday 10 December 2014, featuring our client and its Horizon computer system.

Our client is still unclear as to the allegations which are to be made against it in the programme, despite various exchanges of correspondence. As you are well aware, under your own Editorial Guidelines and the Ofcom Broadcasting Code, if there are any allegations of wrongdoing or incompetence, or other significant allegations, our client should normally be given an appropriate and timely opportunity (or, under the BBC Guidelines, a “fair” opportunity) to respond. There can be no reason why our client should not be given such an opportunity in this case. Until our client has been notified of any and all allegations which are proposed to be made, our client reserves its right to submit further statement(s) by way of response. Please ensure that, should the programme go ahead featuring our client, our client’s position in relation to any such allegations is properly and fairly represented.

The mediation process which has been ongoing and which was agreed between our client and the other parties, including the various individual subpostmasters, is subject to confidentiality obligations on all sides. As has been made clear to the BBC, our client takes these obligations very seriously and, notwithstanding any information which may have been imparted to the BBC by other parties to the mediation process, is therefore unable to comment on any individual cases. There are, however,

---

UK - 202576766.6

CMS Cameron McKenna LLP is a limited liability partnership registered in England and Wales with registration number OC310335. It is a body corporate which uses the word “partner” to refer to a member, or an employee or consultant with equivalent standing and qualifications. It is authorised and regulated by the Solicitors Regulation Authority of England and Wales with SRA number 423370 and by the Law Society of Scotland with registered number 47313. A list of members and their professional qualifications is open to inspection at the registered office, Mitre House, 160 Aldersgate Street, London EC1A 4DD. Members are either solicitors or registered foreign lawyers. VAT registration number: 974 899 925. Further information about the firm can be found at [www.cms-cmck.com](http://www.cms-cmck.com)

CMS Cameron McKenna LLP is a member of CMS Legal Services EEIG (CMS EEIG), a European Economic Interest Grouping that coordinates an organisation of independent law firms. CMS EEIG provides no client services. Such services are solely provided by CMS EEIG’s member firms in their respective jurisdictions. CMS EEIG and each of its member firms are separate and legally distinct entities, and no such entity has any authority to bind any other. CMS EEIG and each member firm are liable only for their own acts or omissions and not those of each other. The brand name “CMS” and the term “firm” are used to refer to some or all of the member firms or their offices. Further information can be found at [www.cmslegal.com](http://www.cmslegal.com)

Notice: the firm does not accept service by e-mail of court proceedings, other processes or formal notices of any kind without specific prior written agreement.



Law . Tax

important issues which need to be taken into account and which should be properly reflected in any broadcast in order that our client's position is fairly represented.

Any reference to the Horizon system clearly needs to be seen in the context of some 6 million different transactions conducted through the system every day, and the tens of thousands of people in the different subpostoffices who carry on their businesses using the system with no difficulty and with no such issues arising. This important issue should be made clear in the event of the programme featuring our client.

Our client, of course, understands the emotional and financial effect on the individual subpostmasters. However, our client had a clear duty to investigate the various shortfalls at the individual post offices, a number of which were substantial. Any broadcast should make clear that our client had such a duty. Nevertheless, it was partly with a view to addressing the personal impact of these matters on the individuals and to address the concerns which had been raised by the Justice for Subpostmasters Alliance and MPs representing subpostmasters, that our client set up its Complaints and Mediation Scheme, with the former Lord Justice of Appeal, the Right Honourable Sir Anthony Hooper, as the independent Chair. Our client also commissioned an independent review of the Horizon system, which has found no systemic faults with the system.

Of those subpostmasters who applied to the Scheme, in the region of one-quarter were convicted. In relation to those with convictions, the individuals, with the benefit of legal advice, either pleaded guilty to criminal charges or, in a very small number of cases, the judge and jury heard evidence from the individual subpostmaster concerned. In one case, the evidence included expert opinion from Charles McLachlan, one of the experts who we understand is intended to be featured in the programme. Having heard and considered all the evidence, the jury found the defendants to be guilty. Further, it is, of course, the relevant judge, having heard the facts and the evidence, who passes sentence.

Any broadcast which does not fully reflect these issues is likely to cause serious harm to our client, and is likely to result in serious financial loss. In this respect, there can be no doubt that the individual subpostmasters are not neutral, independent sources, but will clearly each have an axe to grind. As such, their stories should be treated with real caution.

All of our client's rights are reserved.

Yours faithfully

**GRO**

**GRO**

**CMS Cameron McKenna LLP**

Cc Jane French, Editor – Current Affairs BBC South (by email)