

Justice For Subpostmasters Alliance

The Rt. Hon. Theresa May, MP
Prime Minister
10 Downing Street
London
SW1A 2AA

30th April 2019

Reference: Letter to Kelly Tolhurst MP, Minister for Postal Affairs Regarding the Judgment of the "Common Issues" trial in the High Court between Alan Bates & Others and Post Office Limited

Dear Prime Minister

I am writing to you with regard to the enclosed copy of a letter that I have sent to Kelly Tolhurst MP, the current Minister for Postal Affairs, as I have real concerns that the department is being misguided over the legal position on this matter which it reflects in that department's letter to Members of the House of Commons dated 18 March 2019 (enclosed).

I ask you to make a request of that department to seek the independent legal and IT expert advice that I suggest in my letter to the Minister, which may lead to negating the need for continuing our legal action against Post Office Limited. The content of that letter and its accompanying binder, a copy of which I have also included for you, clearly demonstrates that a matter Post Office Limited has been trying to dismiss and keep hidden for many years, is now, albeit slowly, heading towards a conclusion which, with the attitude of the present Board of Post Office Limited, will leave the Post Office network in tatters.

Over the years we have received significant cross-party support, which of recent has been on hold because of the legal action. However, we are now beginning to emerge from the other side of this action and the evidence that has been exposed in court about Post Office Limited and its Horizon system, has been utterly damning, resulting in Parliamentary Questions already starting to be asked.

I do appreciate that your time is valuable and the enclosed Judgments are lengthy, but I do hope that you at least manage to read my letter to the Minister and can see why the current path we have been forced to follow could eventually destroy a major British institution.

Sincerely

GRO

Alan Bates
Chairman
Justice For Subpostmasters Alliance

Encl.:

- Letter to Kelly Tolhurst MP 30 April 2019
- BEIS letter 18 March 2019
- Judgment (No.3) "Common Issues"
- Judgment (No.4) "Recusal Application"

Alan Bates

GRO

GRO

alan.bates@jfsa.org.uk **GRO**

Case No: HQ16X01238

Neutral Citation Number: [2019] EWHC 606 (QB)

THE POST OFFICE GROUP LITIGATION

IN THE HIGH COURT OF JUSTICE
QUEENS BENCH DIVISION

Rolls Building
Fetter Lane
London, EC4A 1NL

Date: 15 March 2019

Before :

THE HONOURABLE MR JUSTICE FRASER

Between :

Alan Bates and Others
- and -
Post Office Limited

Claimant

Defendant

Judgment (No.3) "Common Issues"

Patrick Green QC, Kathleen Donnelly, Henry Warwick, Ognjen Miletic and Reanne Mackenzie (instructed by Freeths LLP) for the **Claimants**
David Cavender QC, Owain Draper and Gideon Cohen (instructed by Womble Bond Dickinson LLP) for the **Defendant**

Hearing dates: 7, 8, 12, 13, 14, 15, 19, 20, 21, 22 and 26 November 2018
3, 4, 5 and 6 December 2018
Draft distributed to parties on 8 March 2019

Mr Justice Fraser:

A. Introduction

1.	This judgment is in the following parts:	<i>Paragraph no.</i>
A.	Introduction	1
B.	The Common Issues	44
C.	The Lead Claimants	46
D.	The Post Office Witnesses	365
E.	The Factual Matrix	568
F.	The Relationship between the Post Office and the National Federation of Sub Postmasters ("NFSP")	574
G.	Contractual Formation	599
H.	The Contract Terms	607
I.	Express and Implied terms	690
J.	Relational Contracts	702
K.	Supply of Goods and Services Act	769
L.	Agency, Accounting and Horizon	782
M.	Suspension and Termination	865
N.	Assistants	938
O.	Onerous or Unusual Terms	957
P.	Unfair Contract Terms	1063
Q.	Conclusions and Summary	1111
R.	Answers to the Common Issues	1122

Appendix 1: Extracts of the relevant SPMC terms

Appendix 2: Extracts of the relevant NTC terms

Appendix 3: Agreed Flow chart for Transaction Corrections

Appendix 4: Agreed Flow chart for Branch Trading Statement

Appendix 5: Appendix 2 of document dated 7 September 2012 entitled Branch Audit Trend Analysis YTD Q1 2012/2013 {G/7/6}