

Second Witness Statement of Simon Recaldin – Appendix I – Differences in the parameters of the responses to information requests

Response	Date range	Case types within scope	Offence types within scope	Individuals within scope	Prosecuting authority
FOI20160825092 1 (29 September 2016)¹	2010/2011 to 2016/2017	Likely prosecutions including convictions and non-convictions	Likely all offences committed by SPMs	Likely SPMs only (and unknown job types excluded)	Likely POL (or RMG pre-separation) only (and cases where the prosecutor was unknown/unclear likely excluded)
FOI2020/00186 (22 May 2020)	1991 to 2020 ²	Confirmed convictions only ³ (Cases where the conviction date was unknown were included within a separate row entitled 'unknown' ⁴)	All offence types	SPMs, assistants, Post Office workers (e.g. those in Crown Post Offices), and cases where the job title was 'unknown' ⁵	POL or (RMG pre-separation) Cases where the prosecutor was unknown/unclear were excluded
Hamilton & Others (23 March 2021)	1996 to 2013	Recorded convictions pre-1999, and cases treated as convictions for the purposes of the PCDE post-1999 (including 'unconfirmed	All offence types for pre-1999 cases ⁷ but only Horizon-related cases ⁸ for post-1999 cases	Any individual	POL or (for RMG pre-separation), and any case where it was unknown/unclear who the prosecutor was.

¹ N.b. It has not been possible to confirm the parameters of this response.

² Although the request was for data from 1990 to 2020, the response was confined to 1991 to 2020.

³ This figure excluded cases where it was not possible to confirm whether there had been a conviction.

⁴ As the data was further reconciled and analysed, the conviction dates for some of these cases were subsequently identified.

⁵ This is because it was thought that unknown individuals might fall within the parameters of the request, but non-POL employees and individuals with job titles such as 'engineer' or 'cleaner' were not included as they were understood not to fall within the request.

⁷ Including cases treated as not involving a shortfall in branch accounts such as robbery and burglary, and 'other' cases. The note provided to the CACD on 25 March 2021 also contained a breakdown excluding robbery and burglary cases but still including 'other' cases.

⁸ 'Horizon-related' refers to cases which relied on Horizon evidence in whole or in part.

		convictions ⁶) as at 23.3.2021 ⁶			
FOI2021/00353 (20 May 2021)	2015 to 2019	Prosecutions (whether or not they resulted in conviction)	All offences in respect of first question ⁹ and shortfall cases in respect of second question ¹⁰	Any individual	POL
R9(6) (15 December 2021)	2000 to 2015	In respect of convictions, cases treated as convictions for the purposes of the PCDE (including 'unconfirmed convictions') as at 15.12.2021 Prosecution numbers for 2000 onwards also provided	Cases presumed to be Horizon-related cases for the purposes of the PCDE	Any individual	POL or (for cases pre-separation) RMG, and any case where it was unknown/unclear who the prosecutor was.
FOI2022/00304 25 May 2022	1989 to 1999	Cases recorded (but not verified) as convictions	Shortfall cases ¹¹	All individuals	POL or (for cases pre-separation) RMG, and any case where it was unknown/unclear who the prosecutor was.
FOI2023/00096	1990 and 1999 (in respect of	In respect of convictions from 1990 to 1999,	All offence types	SPMs only	POL or (for cases pre-separation) RMG, and any

⁶ Pre-2000 figures based on early casework spreadsheets, post-1999 figures based on casework spreadsheets and further verification.

⁹ The last time POL prosecuted an individual (2019).

¹⁰ The last time POL prosecuted in respect of a shortfall in branch accounts (2015).

¹¹ Excluding cases in the 'other' category where it was considered unlikely to be a case involving a shortfall in branch accounts.

24 March 2023	convictions), and 2000 and 2009 in respect of prosecutions	cases recorded (but not verified) as convictions Prosecution numbers for 2000 onwards also provided			case where it was unknown/unclear who the prosecutor was.
----------------------	--	--	--	--	---