

---

**From:** Hugh Flemington[/O=MMS/OU=EXCHANGE ADMINISTRATIVE GROUP (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/CN=RECIPIENTS/CN=HUGH.FLEMINGTON14106A9A-9886-403D-BF5B-E08821F432B3]  
**Sent:** Thur 13/09/2012 2:37:31 PM (UTC)  
**To:** Lesley J Sewell [GRO]; Susan Crichton [GRO]  
**Subject:** FW: URGENT EXPERT REPORT ON HORIZON SYSTEM

FYI only

We need FJ to do this report for us in relation to criminal cases involving Horizon.

---

**From:** Jarnail A Singh  
**Sent:** 13 September 2012 15:30  
**To:** Penny.Thomas [GRO]  
**Cc:** Hugh Flemington; John M Scott  
**Subject:** URGENT EXPERT REPORT ON HORIZON SYSTEM

Dear Penny

It was nice to talk with you this morning.

As the Post Office continues to have absolute confidence in the robustness and integrity of its Horizon system and its branch accounting processes, it had no hesitation in agreeing to an external review of these few individual cases referred by members of parliaments. In order to provide assurance to the interested parties, independent Auditors, 2<sup>nd</sup> Sight were appointed. Also in order to take consistent approach in cases where Horizon has been challenged and to deal with disclosure an investigation officer was appointed to assist in the contested cases, civil and criminal, in which the Horizon system has been challenged. The officers has provided a comprehensive report concluding in old and existing cases only a general complaints has been made by sub post masters without giving details of compliant or specific areas of compliant or even no explanation has been offered as to what has gone wrong. The officer has Confirmed that the Horizon system has never been successfully challenged. The officer has completed a report and also prepared a summary of those cases where there is a proper attack on the system. We need to appoint an expert this being such an specialist area we need one of your members to file this role as matter of urgency with court cases upon us.

The expert will need to address the report to the following issues:

- 1) A description of the horizon system (In laymen's terms so that a jury can understand what it is and what it does)
- 2) A declaration that it has yet to be attacked successfully.
- 3) A summary of the basic attacks made on the system concentrating on any expert reports served in past cases. If there are none then state that no expert has yet been found by any defence team civil or criminal to attack the system. (at the moment there seems to be little more than griping by defendants that the system must be at fault without saying how)
- 4) Plainly, like all accounting systems, there is room for human error (Keying in wrong amounts etc) but the expert should be able to state that innocent human error is unlikely to produce the types of discrepancies of many thousands of pounds over many months.

A report along these lines will go a long way to putting this issue to bed.

My telephone number is [GRO]

Regards

Jarnail Singh