

womblebond dickinson.com



5 March 2019

Freeths LLP  
100 Wellington Street  
Leeds  
West Yorkshire  
LS1 4LT

**By email only**

**Womble Bond Dickinson (UK) LLP**

Oceana House  
39-49 Commercial Road  
Southampton  
SO15 1GA

Tel: [GRO]  
Fax: [GRO]  
DX: 38517 Southampton 3

andrew.parsons [GRO]  
Direct: [GRO]

Our ref:  
AP6/AP6/364065.1369  
Your ref:

**Email:** james.hartley [GRO] imogen.randall [GRO]

Dear Sirs

**Post Office Group Litigation  
Redacted Documents**

We write further to your letter of 5 March 2019.

As per your request, Post Office's legal team and junior Counsel have reviewed the redacted documents with which you have raised concerns. A response to each concern is set out at Schedule 1 to this letter. For a number of documents the redactions applied have been narrowed and replacement documents will be provided to Elevate. Where these documents are in the trial bundle we shall arrange for replacement documents to be uploaded.

The challenges to these redactions have been raised three working days before the beginning of the Horizon Issues Trial. With the exception of two documents, the Claimants were provided with disclosure of these documents in either July or August 2018. The Claimants have had 6 months to raise concerns about the redactions applied but has chosen not to do so until now. Given that the review of these documents is a time-consuming process and would be a large distraction from and prejudice to Post Office's trial preparation it would not be appropriate for Post Office's leading Counsel to review these documents. We trust that our response addresses your concerns.

It should be noted that where redactions have been narrowed or removed we do not believe these documents to have any bearing on the Horizon Issues Trial since the redactions covered irrelevant information. These redactions have been removed only for the sake of co-operation and to reduce the scope of any disputes between the parties over the redaction of documents.

Yours faithfully

**Womble Bond Dickinson (UK) LLP**

Womble Bond Dickinson (UK) LLP is a limited liability partnership registered in England and Wales under number OC317661. VAT registration number is GB123393627. Registered office: 4 More London Riverside, London, SE1 2AU, where a list of members' names is open to inspection. We use the term partner to refer to a member of the LLP, or an employee or consultant who is of equivalent standing. Womble Bond Dickinson (UK) LLP is authorised and regulated by the Solicitors Regulation Authority. Womble Bond Dickinson (UK) LLP is a member of Womble Bond Dickinson (International) Limited, which consists of independent and autonomous law firms providing services in the US, the UK, and elsewhere around the world. Each Womble Bond Dickinson entity is a separate legal entity and is not responsible for the acts or omissions of, nor can bind or obligate, another Womble Bond Dickinson entity. Womble Bond Dickinson (International) Limited does not practise law. Please see [www.womblebond dickinson.com/legal](http://www.womblebond dickinson.com/legal) notices for further details.

## SCHEDULE 1

Trial Bundle Reference	Begin Bates	WBD Comment	Comments to Counsel – <b>any redactions which are proposed to be removed are highlighted in yellow.</b> <b>Colum to be deleted before being sent to Freeths</b>
F/1415 & F/1416	POL-0220141 POL-0444078	<p>As explained in our letter of 3 January 2019, an incorrect redacted version of the document was exhibited to Mr Godeseth's witness statement.</p> <p>A re-review of part-privileged documents which contain the term "mediation scheme" has been undertaken. Redactions applied to POL-0022823, POL-0024131, POL-0025092, POL-0511200 and POL-0025094 have been removed.</p>	<p>14 documents were responsive to this search – see documents in the folder "Mediation Scheme STR Documents"</p> <p>One of these documents is document G below and comments on that document are against G.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• 02_POL-0219724 – redacted email chain which discusses obtaining information from FJ for the purposes of investigating a mediation scheme case. Litigation privilege.</li> <li>• 03_POL-0221555 – collection of board papers. Unless stated otherwise these have been redacted on the basis of irrelevance and confidentiality. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>○ 2 to 10 – Prosecutions policy. Privileged document.</li> <li>○ 11 to 16 - Business Improvement Programme. Section has been disclosed.</li> <li>○ 17 to 22 – 2014/15 Scorecard. Pages 19 and 20 sections on Horizon availability has been disclosed.</li> <li>○ 23 to 87 – Statement of public purpose.</li> <li>○ 88 to 91 - Business Transformation Programme.</li> <li>○ 92 to 109 – Business Transformation operating model.</li> <li>○ 110 to 113 – Network and sales.</li> <li>○ 114 to 136 - R&amp;CC Policy Adoption Request</li> <li>○ 137 to 145 – Information Security and Assurance – acceptable use policy.</li> <li>○ 146 to 148 - Cyber Security and Information Assurance</li> <li>○ 149 to 152 – Data Centre Tower Procurement</li> <li>○ 153 to 154 – Delegated authorities for remuneration matters.</li> </ul> </li> <li>• 04_POL-0215598 – collection of board papers. Unless stated otherwise these have been redacted on the basis of irrelevance and confidentiality. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>○ 2 to 15 – Review of current prosecution</li> </ul> </li> </ul>

Trial Bundle Reference	Begin Bates	WBD Comment	Comments to Counsel – <b>any redactions which are proposed to be removed are highlighted in yellow.</b> <b>Column to be deleted before being sent to Freeths</b>
			<p>policy. Privileged document. Chris Aujard was GC. However, Appendix B has been disclosed due to it being a document containing information that would no longer be confidential and being produced by Mark Davies (Comms Director).</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>○ 16 to 20 – Initial Compliant Review and Mediation Scheme. Privileged document.</li> <li>○ 19 to 25 - Branch Support Programme. Section disclosed.</li> <li>○ 26 to 32 - Business Transformation Programme.</li> <li>○ 33 to 44 – Statement of public purpose.</li> <li>○ 45 to 48 – Network and sales.</li> <li>○ 49 to 51 – Chief Execs Report.</li> <li>○ 52 to 62 – Performance Report Jan 2014. Details of Horizon availability on page 60 have been disclosed.</li> <li>○ 63 to 85 – Policy adoption</li> <li>○ 86 to 89 – Status Report. Section on Project Sparrow and prosecuting authority has been redacted on the basis it refers to privileged information or is irrelevant.</li> <li>○ 90 to 93 – Data Centre Tower Procurement</li> <li>○ 94 to 96 - Cyber Security and Information Assurance</li> <li>○ 97 to 99– Dispute Resolution matters. Privileged.</li> <li>○ 100 to 104 – Health and Safety Report</li> <li>○ 105 to 107 – Register of sealings</li> </ul> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• 05_POL-0022823 – email marked as privileged but incorrect use of privilege. <b>Redactions to be removed.</b></li> <li>• 06_POL-0024131 - email marked as privileged but incorrect use of privilege. <b>Redactions to be removed.</b></li> <li>• 07_POL-0025092 - email marked as privileged but incorrect use of privilege. <b>Redactions to be removed.</b></li> <li>• 08_POL-0025094 - email marked as privileged but incorrect use of privilege. <b>Redactions to be removed.</b></li> </ul>

Trial Bundle Reference	Begin Bates	WBD Comment	Comments to Counsel – any redactions which are proposed to be removed are highlighted in yellow. Column to be deleted before being sent to Freeths
			<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>09_POL-0219843 – collection of board papers. Unless stated otherwise these have been redacted on the basis of irrelevance and confidentiality.               <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>2 to 14 - Talent attractions – resourcing update</li> <li>15 to 21 – Communications calendar</li> <li>22 to 34 – transforming the insurance operating model</li> <li>35 to 38 - Branch support programme improvement update. Section has been disclosed.</li> <li>39 to 46 – POL response to Second Sight's Thematic Issues. Produced for purposes of litigation so as to update board. Query whether this is a strong claim for privilege and if we should remove.</li> <li>47 to 52 – Current actions and decision log</li> <li>53 to 57 – Health and Safety report.</li> </ul> </li> <li>10_POL-0511200 – redactions on pages 22 and 40. Redaction to be removed.</li> <li>11_POL-0221031 – redacted references to "Sparrow" which is a privileged project.</li> <li>12_POL-0215603 – section of Horizon outage has been disclosed.</li> <li>13_POL-0219338 – redacted reference to legal advice received on the recovery of debt during Mediation Scheme and Group Action.</li> <li>14_POL-0031469 – See rows 91, 129, 240, 314, 471, 602, 607, 608, 622, 1591. Redactions due to references to legal advice.</li> </ul>
F/864	POL-0215569	<p>Document has been redacted on the basis of confidentiality and irrelevance. This document does not contain similar text to that contained in POL-0215720 and all relevant / adverse sections have been disclosed.</p> <p><i>[Note – your letter refers to POL-0121520 but the correct reference is POL-0215720]</i></p>	<p>A</p> <p>Information on Horizon availability on page 12 has been disclosed. Remainder of document irrelevant.</p>
F/1017	POL-0215581	<p>Document has been redacted on the basis of confidentiality</p>	<p>B</p> <p>Information on Horizon availability on page 10 has been</p>



Trial Bundle Reference	Begin Bates	WBD Comment	Comments to Counsel – <b>any redactions which are proposed to be removed are highlighted in yellow.</b> <b>Column to be deleted before being sent to Freeths</b>
		and irrelevance. This document does not contain similar text to that contained in POL-0215720 and all relevant / adverse sections have been disclosed.  <i>[Note – your letter refers to POL-0121520 but the correct reference is POL-0215720]</i>	disclosed. Remainder of document irrelevant
F/619	POL-0215622	Document has been redacted on the basis of confidentiality and irrelevance. The redacted text does not contain information which would provide context of the unredacted sections.	C  Information on Horizon on pages 1, 2, 3 and 5 has been disclosed. Remainder of document irrelevant.
F/639	POL-0215539	Document has been redacted on the basis of confidentiality and irrelevance. The section on "Executive Correspondence (flagcases)" is a standalone paragraph in the document and the remainder of the document does not assist with the context of understanding of this paragraph.  We understand that the "purdah" refers to the restrictions which were placed on MPs during the 2010 elections.	D  Information on Horizon has been disclosed. Remainder of document irrelevant.
F/658	POL-0215545	Document has been redacted on the basis of confidentiality and irrelevance. Whilst we do not believe these sections to be relevant to the Horizon Issues Trial, the redaction of the sections under the heading of IT have been removed. We confirm there is no document author within the redacted sections of the document.	E  <b>Redactions in section 2 to be removed.</b>  Information on Horizon has been disclosed. Remainder of document irrelevant.
F/657	POL-0215543	Document has been redacted on the basis of confidentiality and irrelevance. The redaction at the end of this document has been removed so as to show the author of	F  <b>Redaction at the end of page 3 to be removed.</b>  Information on Horizon has been disclosed. Remainder

Trial Bundle Reference	Begin Bates	WBD Comment	Comments to Counsel – <b>any redactions which are proposed to be removed are highlighted in yellow.</b> <b>Column to be deleted before being sent to Freeths</b>
		the document.	of document irrelevant.
F/1135	POL-0215589	The majority of the document has been redacted on the basis of confidentiality and irrelevance. Some sections of the document has been redacted on the basis of legal advice and/or litigation privilege.	<p>G – collection of board papers. Unless stated otherwise these have been redacted on the basis of irrelevance and confidentiality..</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• 2 to 12 – progress report on government funding and strategic plan</li> <li>• 13 to 17 – costs management update</li> <li>• 18 to 25 – supply chain net costs management programme and future roadmap</li> <li>• 26 to 29 - Service Integrator / Service Desk Contract Award. Paper deals with the award of the SISD contract to ATOs. Not relevant to any of the Horizon Issues or adverse.</li> <li>• 30 to 33 – IT Strategy Update September 2013. Paper contains information on FJ signing the Transitional Support Services agreement which extend the HNGx agreement from April 15 to March 17. Does not appear relevant or adverse.</li> <li>• 34 to 39 – Chief Exec report.</li> <li>• 40 to 44 – Project Sparrow. This is privileged, update to the board on mediation scheme. Susan Crichton was GC at this time.</li> <li>• 45 to 61 – August 2013 Performance Report. The Horizon Availability stats on page 54 have been disclosed.</li> <li>• 62 to 63 – Top Board Risks. Section 7 on Horizon has been disclosed.</li> <li>• 64 to 66 – Status Report. Section 6, review of Second Sight Report to explain how awarded and managed the contract does not seem to be relevant and may be a reference to privileged output.</li> <li>• 67 to 70 – POL Board away day log.</li> <li>• 71 to 74 – Dispute resolution matter. Section is privileged.</li> <li>• 75 to 80 - Health and safety report.</li> <li>• 81 to 83 – Register of sealings</li> <li>• 84 to 175 – New articles of association</li> <li>• 176 to 180 – Minutes of Audit, Risk and Compliance sub-committee</li> <li>• 181 to 184 – minutes of pensions sub-committee</li> <li>• 185 to 188 – Minutes of Audit, Risk and Compliance sub-committee</li> </ul>

Trial Bundle Reference	Begin Bates	WBD Comment	Comments to Counsel – <b>any redactions which are proposed to be removed are highlighted in yellow.</b> Column to be deleted before being sent to Freeths
			<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• 189 – Minutes of Audit, Risk and Compliance sub-committee</li> <li>• 190 - minutes of pensions sub-committee</li> <li>• 191 to 193 – minutes of board meeting</li> <li>• 194 to 196 - minutes of board meeting. Details about Horizon on 194 and 195 have been disclosed.</li> <li>• 197 to 198 - minutes of board meeting.</li> <li>• 199 to 208 - minutes of board meeting. Discussing the Transition Support Services contract on page 201 which is not relevant to the Horizon Issues.</li> </ul> <p>Section (a) of Horizon update on page 204 has been disclosed. Section (b) to (g) have been redacted on the basis of privilege and the irrelevance of awarding of the contract to Second Sight.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• 209 - minutes of board meeting. Discussing the Transitional Support Services contract which is not relevant to the Horizon Issues.</li> <li>• 210 to 211 - minutes of board meeting.</li> <li>• 212 - minutes of pensions sub-committee</li> </ul>
F/1664	POL-0221328	<p>The majority of the document has been redacted on the basis of confidentiality and irrelevance. Some sections of the document has been redacted on the basis of legal advice and/or litigation privilege.</p> <p>For assurance, the pages which follow 87and 88 do not relate to transaction corrections.</p>	<p>H - collection of board papers. Unless stated otherwise these have been redacted on the basis of irrelevance and confidentiality.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• 1 to 2 – actions for June 2017 operations board.</li> <li>• 4 to 22 – Health and safety update</li> <li>• 23 to 29 – Cash management report</li> <li>• 30 to 47 - Supply chain ops board update</li> <li>• 48 to 80 – Network Operations</li> <li>• 81 to 94 – Operations Board. Pages 86 to 88 have been disclosed and sections of 90 and 91</li> <li>• 94 to 109 – IT Performance. All pages disclosed.</li> </ul>
F/1180	POL-0220835	Document has been redacted on the basis that it refers to legally privileged material.	<p>I</p> <p>Redactions of reference to Project Sparrow (pages 1, 6,7 and 11) which is the Group Action.</p>
F/1217	POL-0220855	Document has been redacted on the basis that it refers to legally privileged material.	<p>J</p> <p>Redactions of reference to Project Sparrow (pages 3, 6) which is the Group Action</p>

<b>Trial Bundle Reference</b>	<b>Begin Bates</b>	<b>WBD Comment</b>	<b>Comments to Counsel – any redactions which are proposed to be removed are highlighted in yellow. Column to be deleted before being sent to Freeths</b>
F/123	POL-0444058	The document which you have referred to is an unredacted document. Please could you confirm the correct trial bundle reference.	
F/1350	POL-0221527	Document has been redacted on the basis that it refers to legally privileged material.	K Redactions of reference to Project Sparrow (page 2) which is the Group Action
F/1420	POL-0143345	The document which you have referred to is an unredacted document. Please could you confirm the correct trial bundle reference.	
F/1501	POL-0221075	Document has been redacted on the basis that it refers to legally privileged material.	L Redactions of reference to Project Sparrow (page 4) which is the Group Action
F/1520	POL-0221124	Document has been redacted on the basis that it refers to legally privileged material.	M Redactions of reference to Project Sparrow (pages 4 and 34) which is the Group Action
F/1540	POL-0220593	Document has been redacted on the basis that it refers to legally privileged material.	N Redactions of reference to Project Sparrow which is the Group Action. The recommendations from Project Sparrow are privileged.
F/1634	POL-0221290	Document has been redacted on the basis that it refers to legally privileged material.	O Redactions of reference to Project Sparrow which is the Group Action. The recommendations from Project Sparrow are privileged. See page 7.
F/1495.2	POL-0511132	Document has been redacted on the basis that it refers to legally privileged material.	P Jane is the GC. Reference to work which would be covered by legal advice or litigation privilege – claim form was issued in April 16.
F/1495.3	POL-0511131	Document has been redacted on the basis that it refers to legally privileged material.	Q Jane is the GC. Reference to work which would be covered by legal advice or litigation privilege – claim form was issued in April 16.
F/1549	POL-0220220	Document has been redacted on the basis that it refers to legally privileged material.	R Redactions of reference to Project Sparrow which is the Group Action. The recommendations or concerns from Project Sparrow are privileged.