

To: Mark Dinsdale [GRO] Nigel Allen [GRO]
Cc: Mike Wilcox [GRO]
From: Jason G Collins
Sent: Fri 8 10 2010 8:59:13 AM
Subject: FW: ARQ requests - Barkham Post Office 212939

Mark/Nigel

I've passed on the details to Mike Wilcox, who will review the information over the course of the next week or so in line with his own operational workloads. I've asked that he report back his findings in regards to the matter and we can then make an informed decision on any potential grounds for an investigation case.

Regards,

Jason

From: Mark Dinsdale
Sent: 07 October 2010 19:41
To: Nigel Allen
Cc: Jason G Collins; Iain Murphy; Jane M Owen
Subject: RE: ARQ requests - Barkham Post Office 212939

Nigel,

Jason is currently having one of his team review this to consider what steps can be taken. One of us will therefore be in touch very shortly.

Regards
Mark Dinsdale

From: Mark Dinsdale
Sent: 27 September 2010 13:23
To: Nigel Allen
Cc: Jason G Collins; Iain Murphy
Subject: FW: ARQ requests - Barkham Post Office 212939

Nigel, this unfortunately is not so straight forward.

I understand Jason asked you a number of questions in an email 21 June and stated that with the information to hand at that time that they could not engage from an investigation perspective. As a result of that email, I suspect this is why the ARQ was requested by the live service desk and the information was provided to enable further checks.

In light that the information still doesn't answer the questions posed, I have asked Jason and Iain to consider how this is taken forward, i.e. we raise a case or not, and shall return a response as soon as I can.

Regards
Mark Dinsdale

From: Iain Murphy
Sent: 21 September 2010 08:25
To: Mark Dinsdale
Cc: Jason G Collins
Subject: RE: ARQ requests - Barkham Post Office 212939

Mark,

Please pass to Jason to have a look at.

Thanks,

Iain

From: Mark Dinsdale
Sent: 17 September 2010 20:24
To: Iain Murphy
Subject: FW: ARQ requests - Barkham Post Office 212939
Importance: High

Iain, sorry I run out of time to ring you and I'm off on Monday.

I think in a nut shell, I think we need to decide if one of the investigators who have the knowledge to sit and sift through what has been provided along with the ARQ and go and see what the ex-spmr is holding. I think this is going to be a very onerous task, but I can't see how we can let this one go considering she is questioning the integrity of Horizon.

How do you want me to deal with this one? Jason did offer some advice, but I think it has grown to be a more serious problem now with what has subsequently come to light, i.e. auditor corroborating the spmr's account.

Regards
Mark

From: Mark Dinsdale
Sent: 14 September 2010 12:05
To: Andy Hayward; Iain Murphy
Subject: FW: ARQ requests - Barkham Post Office 212939
Importance: High

Andy / Iain

This is quickly turning into a bit of a problem.

This is a potential fraud where losses occurred when a spmr moved into a portacabin, but ceased the moment she was suspended and somebody else run the office. She did have a clerk, so it could transpire she has nothing to do with the losses. We are talking about £28k, a potential flag case, with MP's involved. The spmr is questioning the integrity of Horizon.

It looks like contracts/Chesterfield dealt with this themselves, although did speak to investigations. Once I received the paper work from Nigel, it looks like there are numerous activities that have taken place, including somebody sending in an auditor who sat with the spmr for half a day which clearly made matters worse.

I don't know why we were never approached to deal with this as a criminal investigation in the first instance, perhaps it was felt that it wasn't at the time. The auditor supposedly witness all transactions for half a day and witness Horizon being short, thereby corroborating her account and also now a potential witness for her (when in fact clearly he can not have witnessed everything), and also begs the question as to why it was left 'high and dry' at the time and Credence was not checked etc.

This now leaves us in a very difficult situation. With the spmr writing letters to Dave Smith, her MP and no doubt countless other people, this is high profile. She has also joined the spmr's fight to question the integrity of Horizon. As it stands no investigation has taken place by us, various intervention has probably complicated this, yet because it is a question of Horizon integrity we can't simply ignore it, or drop it, but probably have some difficult questions ahead of us in terms of why has it taken so long for us to consider this criminal if this is the course of action we take.

Regards
Mark

From: Nigel Allen
Sent: 13 September 2010 12:47
To: Mark Dinsdale; Duty Manager; Jane M Owen; Emma Langfield
Cc: Lin Norbury
Subject: RE: ARQ requests - Barkham Post Office 212939
Importance: High

Mark

What we're trying to determine here is whether there is any discrepancy between the information sent in to the Live Service team by the spmr, Mrs Stubbs, and what the Horizon system is showing. She is alleging that her losses of £28k+ are due to problems with the Horizon system after it was relocated into a portacabin last October whilst the branch was being renovated.

Can you advise whether a case is being raised on this? Given the fact that we have not experienced similar losses with the temporary spmr who was appointed after Mrs Stubbs was suspended and the same Horizon kit is being used, shouldn't we be asking her some very searching questions under caution?

Redacted

An added complication here is that Mrs Stubbs resigned in May before being suspended in June and her notice has therefore now expired. An applicant has been interviewed and offered the appointment but we are concerned at allowing a transfer to go ahead whilst this debt remains outstanding. **Redacted**

Please advise how this is now to be taken forward.

Regards

Nigel Allen

Contracts Advisor - Central Southern England

Post Office Ltd – Network Support

Upper Floors, The Markets Crown Office, 6-12 New York Street, Leeds, LS2 7DZ



Mobex

GRO



GRO



GRO

Confidential Information: *This e-mail message is for the sole use of the intended recipient (s) and may contain confidential and privileged information. Any unauthorised review, use, disclosure or distribution is prohibited. If you are not the intended recipient, please contact me by reply e-mail and destroy all copies of the original message.*

From: Mark Dinsdale
Sent: 10 September 2010 16:57
To: Nigel Allen; Duty Manager; Jane M Owen; Emma Langfield
Subject: RE: ARQ requests - Barkham Post Office 212939

Nigel, I've extracted the relevant detail for you. I'm not actually sure what's expected to found in this, because these just illustrate what was transacted into Horizon. These highlights all cash declarations and remittances as requested. Hopefully this answers all the questions posed.

Where do you want the paper work sending that was sent to me.

Regards
Mark Dinsdale

04 January 2010 and 05 January 2010

Please provide system logs for all pouch preparations along with remittances inward and outward and any associated reversals on this, please confirm ONCH/Cash for 04/01/2010 and 05/01/2010.

05-Jan-2010	12:34:14	44-212939-1-917197-1	44-212939-1-917197-2	RODP	6509	1	18000	1		
05-Jan-2010	09:17:31	44-212939-1-916827-2	44-212939-1-916827-5	ROSP	5610	-1	-18000			
05-Jan-2010	12:34:14	44-212939-1-917197-1	44-212939-1-917197-3	RODP	6286	-1	-18000			

04-Jan-2010	17:36:21	AWA001	AA	DeclareCash Total £30275.63 For SU AA Till 01	Declaration Complete
05-Jan-2010	17:39:31	PST001	AA	DeclareCash Total £8940.20 For SU AA Till 01	Declaration Complete

09 April 2010

Please provide system logs for all pouch preparations along with remittances inward and outward and any associated reversals on this, please confirm ONCH/Cash for 09 April 2010.

Please provide system logs for transactions and events undertaken on horizon between 00:01 - 10:00 on the same day 09 April 2010

See row 46-49 on attachment 9 Apr 10 for remittances, i.e. £27k, £17k + £10k

See row 65 on attachment Events 9 Apr 10, £11,920.47 cash dec.

PST001	AA	09-Apr-2010	08:06:12	44-212939-1-1006117-2	44-212939-1-1006117-3	ROSP	1	850	17000	
PST001	AA	09-Apr-2010	08:06:12	44-212939-1-1006117-2	44-212939-1-1006117-4	ROSP	5610	-1	-17000	
PST001	AA	09-Apr-2010	08:08:53	44-212939-1-1006124-2	44-212939-1-1006124-3	ROSP	1	1000	10000	
PST001	AA	09-Apr-2010	08:08:53	44-212939-1-1006124-2	44-212939-1-1006124-4	ROSP	5610	-1	-10000	

09-Apr-2010	16:43:28	PST001	AA	DeclareCash Total £11920.47 For SU AA Till 01	Declaration Complete
-------------	----------	--------	----	---	----------------------

18 May 2010

Please provide system log for any ONCH/Cash declarations made by the branch

See row

18-May-2010	16:31:53	PST001	AA	DeclareCash Total £7767.24 For SU AA Till 01	Declaration Complete
-------------	----------	--------	----	--	----------------------

PST002	AA	18-May-2010	07:58:54	44-212939-2-2543824-2	44-212939-2-2543824-3	ROSP	1	650	13000	
PST002	AA	18-May-2010	07:58:54	44-212939-2-2543824-2	44-212939-2-2543824-4	ROSP	1	1000	10000	

PST002	AA	18-May-2010	07:58:54	44-212939-2-2543824-2	44-212939-2-2543824-5	ROSP	5610	-1	-23000	
--------	----	-------------	----------	-----------------------	-----------------------	------	------	----	--------	--

AWA001	AA	18-May-2010	08:13:41	44-212939-1-1045328-1	44-212939-1-1045328-2	RODP	6509	1	23000	1
AWA001	AA	18-May-2010	08:13:41	44-212939-1-1045328-1	44-212939-1-1045328-3	RODP	6286	-1	-23000	

19 May 2010

Please provide system log for any ONCH/Cash declarations made by the branch

19-May-2010	07:06:46	PST001	AA	DeclareCash Total £7767.24 For SU AA Till 01	Declaration Complete
19-May-2010	07:58:10	PST001	AA	DeclareCash Total £7767.24 For SU AA Till 01	Declaration Complete
19-May-2010	08:01:23	PST001	AA	DeclareCash Total £13441.30 For SU AA Till 01	Declaration Complete
19-May-2010	12:09:13	PST001	AA	DeclareCash Total £13441.30 For SU AA Till 01	Declaration Complete
19-May-2010	12:17:02	PST001	AA	DeclareCash Total £11694.61 For SU AA Till 01	Declaration Complete
19-May-2010	12:24:10	PST001	AA	DeclareCash Total £11699.61 For SU AA Till 01	Declaration Complete
19-May-2010	15:38:52	PST001	AA	DeclareCash Total £11699.61 For SU AA Till 01	Declaration Complete
19-May-2010	15:40:53	PST001	AA	DeclareStamp Total £4554.04 For SU AA Till 01	Declaration Complete
19-May-2010	15:42:02	PST001	AA	DeclareCurrency Total £1330.00 For SU AA Till 01	Declaration Complete

09 May 2010

Please provide system log for any ONCH/Cash declarations made by the branch

Nil – this is a Sunday

28 May 2010

Please provide system log for all pouch preparations along with remittances inward and outward with any associated reversals.

28-May-2010	12:06:31	AWA001	AA	DeclareCash Total £6429.33 For SU AA Till 01	Declaration Complete
28-May-2010	13:12:38	PST001	AA	DeclareCash Total £6429.33 For SU AA Till 01	Declaration Complete
28-May-2010	16:33:18	PST001	AA	DeclareCash Total £5567.38 For SU AA Till 01	Declaration Complete

PST002	AA	28-May-2010	08:07:25	44-212939-2-2545896-2	44-212939-2-2545896-3	ROSP	1	1000	20000	
PST002	AA	28-May-2010	08:07:25	44-212939-2-2545896-2	44-212939-2-2545896-4	ROSP	5610	-1	-20000	

PST002	AA	28-May-2010	08:18:11	44-212939-2-2545903-2	44-212939-2-2545903-3	ROSP	1	900	9000	
PST002	AA	28-May-2010	08:18:11	44-212939-2-2545903-2	44-212939-2-2545903-4	ROSP	1	20	400	
PST002	AA	28-May-2010	08:18:11	44-212939-2-2545903-2	44-212939-2-2545903-5	ROSP	1	11	110	
PST002	AA	28-May-2010	08:18:11	44-212939-2-2545903-2	44-212939-2-2545903-6	ROSP	1	19	95	
PST002	AA	28-May-2010	08:18:11	44-212939-2-2545903-2	44-212939-2-2545903-7	ROSP	1	200	1000	
PST002	AA	28-May-2010	08:18:11	44-212939-2-2545903-2	44-212939-2-2545903-8	ROSP	5610	-1	-10605	

From: Nigel Allen
Sent: 10 August 2010 08:51
To: Mark Dinsdale; Duty Manager; Jane M Owen
Subject: RE: ARQ requests - Barkham Post Office 212939

Mark

Thanks for the update.

Once the outcome is known, I will communicate this to Mrs Stubbs although I will be on hols from next week for two weeks, so will discuss with Lin Norbury as to whether someone else may need to pick this up in my absence.

Regards

Nigel Allen

Contracts Advisor - Central Southern England

Post Office Ltd – Network Support

Upper Floors, The Markets Crown Office, 6-12 New York Street, Leeds, LS2 7DZ



Mobex

GRO



GRO



GRO

Confidential Information: This e-mail message is for the sole use of the intended recipient (s) and may contain confidential and privileged information. Any unauthorised review, use,

disclosure or distribution is prohibited. If you are not the intended recipient, please contact me by reply e-mail and destroy all copies of the original message.

From: Mark Dinsdale
Sent: 06 August 2010 17:43
To: Nigel Allen; Duty Manager; Jane M Owen
Subject: RE: ARQ requests - Barkham Post Office 212939

Nigel, we are hoping to get the data asap following a delay in getting ARQ's from Fujitsu.

I'm on A/L now for 2 weeks, so Jane will fire this over when she gets it. Obviously we can't hand the data to the SPMR, will you be handling disclosing what we are able to.

Cheers
Mark

From: Nigel Allen
Sent: 28 July 2010 10:08
To: Duty Manager; Mark Dinsdale; Jane M Owen
Subject: RE: ARQ requests - Barkham Post Office 212939
Importance: High

Dear All

Do we have any news on this yet please?
As you know, this has been the subject of several Flag Cases and the local MP is also taking an active interest.

Thanks
Regards

Nigel Allen

Contracts Advisor - Central Southern England

Post Office Ltd – Network Support

Upper Floors, The Markets Crown Office, 6-12 New York Street, Leeds, LS2 7DZ



Mobex



Confidential Information: *This e-mail message is for the sole use of the intended recipient (s) and may contain confidential and privileged information. Any unauthorised review, use, disclosure or distribution is prohibited. If you are not the intended recipient, please contact me by reply e-mail and destroy all copies of the original message.*

From: Emma Langfield **On Behalf Of** Duty Manager
Sent: 12 July 2010 12:40
To: Mark Dinsdale; Jane M Owen

POL-0153977

E2/104/7

Cc: Nigel Allen
Subject: Re: ARQ requests - Barkham Post Office 212939

Afternoon Mark

Have Fujitsu provided timescales for provision of the requests below.

Many thanks
Emma

Live Service Team
Service Delivery
Post Office Limited

GRO

From: Nigel Allen
Sent: 28 June 2010 22:49
To: Mark Dinsdale
Cc: Jason G Collins; Lin Norbury; Michele Graves
Subject: Re: Fw: Barkham PO 212939 - request from Live Service Team for archived data
Importance: High

Mark

This branch has a very large loss which the spmr is attributing to Horizon. We have already had one Flag case on this and this will remain high profile so the data does need to be retrieved.

Many thanks

Regards

Nigel Allen

Contracts Advisor - South West England

Post Office Ltd – Network Support

NSA Maidstone, Royal Mail Building, 1st Floor Admin Block, 98 Sandling Road, Maidstone,
Kent. ME14 1AA



Mobex

GRO



GRO



GRO

Confidential Information: *This e-mail message is for the sole use of the intended recipient (s) and may contain confidential and privileged information. Any unauthorised review, use, disclosure or distribution is prohibited. If you are not the intended recipient, please contact me by reply e-mail and destroy all copies of the original message.*

Mark Dinsdale

Mark Dinsdale

24/06/2010 17:37

To: Nigel Allen/e/POSTOFFICE
cc: Lin Norbury/e/POSTOFFICE
Michele Graves/e/POSTOFFICE
Jason G Collins/e/POSTOFFICE
Subject: Re: Fw: Barkham PO 212939 - request from

GRO
GRO

Live Service Team for archived data

Nigel, no probs with requesting data from Fujitsu, but it will take around 3 weeks. Has Jason agreed to take this case on, because we don't hand over Horizon logs to a spmr. It needs an expert to understand what it says, and usually this requires one of the investigators.

I'll give Jason a call in the morning, then I will raise an ARQ from Fujitsu

Is this for our benefit, as there is a cost attached to ARQ requests, we do get a supply free of charge as part of the contract but we usually don't have enough, therefore we usually charge the defence lawyers.

Mark Dinsdale
Security Programme Manager
Security Team, Post Office Ltd

Post Office Ltd, Security Team, Royal Mail, 3rd Floor, Clippers House, Clippers Quay, Salford, M50 3NW

GRO

GRO

[Post Office HR Help](#)

Confidential Information:

This email message is for the sole use of the intended recipient(s) and may contain confidential and privileged information. Any unauthorised review, use, disclosure or distribution is prohibited. If you are not the intended recipient please contact me by reply email and destroy all copies of the original message.

To: Mark Dinsdale/e/POSTOFFICE, Jane M Owen/e/POSTOFFICE
cc: Nigel Allen/e/POSTOFFICE
Hard Copy To:
Hard Copy cc:

Date: 22/06/2010 16:17

From: Duty Manager
Sent by: Emma Langfield
Subject: ARQ requests - Barkham Post Office 212939

Afternoon Mark

We are currently in dispute re debts owing by this branch and to bring the matter to a close need to present information which disproves the spmrs assertion that horizon is generating errors. Please see dates and requirements below, could you confirm if Fujitsu will provide via ARQ and whether all requests can be met.

Nigel as discussed I can only request logs for specific queries as the transaction logs in themselves do not amount to evidence.

04 January 2010 and 05 January 2010

Please provide system logs for all pouch preparations along with remittances inward and outward and any associated reversals on this, please confirm ONCH/Cash for 04/01/2010 and 05/01/2010

09 April 2010

Please provide system logs for all pouch preparations along with remittances inward and outward and any associated reversals on this, please confirm ONCH/Cash for 09 April 2010.

Please provide system logs for transactions and events undertaken on horizon between 00:01 - 10:00 on the same day 09 April 2010

18 May 2010

Please provide system log for any ONCH/Cash declarations made by the branch

19 May 2010

Please provide system log for any ONCH/Cash declarations made by the branch

09 May 2010

Please provide system log for any ONCH/Cash declarations made by the branch

28 May 2010

Please provide system log for all pouch preparations along with remittances inward and outward with any associated reversals.

Many thanks
Emma

Live Service Team
Service Delivery
Post Office Limited

GRO

POL-0153977

E2/104/10

----- Forwarded by Nigel Allen/e/POSTOFFICE on 22/06/2010 14:22 -----

Michele Graves

18/06/2010 16:07

To: Lin Norbury/e/POSTOFFICE [GRO]
cc: Eunice Kirby/e/POSTOFFICE [GRO]
Sarah Howard/e/POSTOFFICE [GRO] Nigel
Allen/e/POSTOFFICE [GRO]
Subject: Re: re reply to Mrs Stubbs - Barkham

PO

Thanks Lin

Have made suggested changes & sent.

If we can encourage Mark Dinsdale to authorise the audit trail, I feel it would be beneficial given the current interest in Horizon from media & MP's.

Rgds

Michele Graves
Executive Correspondence Manager
Executive Correspondence Team
Post Office Limited

1st Floor, Bunhill Row Wing, 148 Old Street, LONDON, EC1V 9HQ

phone number [GRO] postline: [GRO]
mobile number [GRO]
[GRO]
fax [GRO]

Confidential Information:

This email message is for the sole use of the intended recipient(s) and may contain confidential and privileged information. Any unauthorised review, use, disclosure or distribution is prohibited. If you are not the intended recipient please contact me by reply email and destroy all copies of the original message.

Lin Norbury

Lin Norbury

18/06/2010 15:22

To: Michele Graves/e/POSTOFFICE [GRO]
cc: Eunice Kirby/e/POSTOFFICE [GRO]
Sarah Howard/e/POSTOFFICE [GRO] Nigel
Allen/e/POSTOFFICE [GRO]
Subject: Re: re reply to Mrs Stubbs - Barkham

PO

Michele
I have changed it slightly.

In terms of the points raised we do have a report from the auditor but it is probably not detailed enough to cover all the points, so we will probably need to go back on this as part of the contractual case. In terms of the audit trail via Horizon we are waiting for Mark Dinsdale to authorise the case as he holds the budget.
Nigel has today referred the case to Jason Collins requesting their involvement given the level of losses - I will forward e-mail separately. Need to see where this gets us before we can move the case forward or start to answer her detailed questions.

Lin
National Contract Manager
Network Support
Post Office Ltd

Mobex [GRO]
External Email: [GRO]
Michele Graves

Michele Graves

18/06/2010 11:22

To: Lin Norbury/e/POSTOFFICE [GRO]
cc: Eunice Kirby/e/POSTOFFICE [GRO]
Sarah Howard/e/POSTOFFICE [GRO]
Subject: re reply to Mrs Stubbs - Barkham PO

Hi Lin

Following our conversation I have prepared the attached draft. See what you think, make any changes and then I will send it out in my name.

Moving forward, can you confirm what your next steps are re the points she has raised. I know you are waiting for the audit trail of the transaction events. Re the comment about the two auditor visits monitoring her work and apparently also having a problem with the figures, are you obtaining a report from the auditor? If this escalates we will need to answer the apparent discrepancies in the figures on his laptop & Horizon.

Finally, when your investigations into the issues she has raised have been completed, will one of your team be writing to Mrs Stubbs or do you want to channel through me? If it comes from your team, can they make reference to the letter to David & that this is the result of investigations into the issues she raised with him. Please advise.

Thanks !

Michele Graves
Executive Correspondence Manager
Executive Correspondence Team
Post Office Limited

1st Floor, Bunhill Row Wing, 148 Old Street, LONDON, EC1V 9HQ

phone number **GRO** Postline: **GRO**
mobile number **GRO**
fax **GRO**

Confidential Information:

This email message is for the sole use of the intended recipient(s) and may contain confidential and privileged information. Any unauthorised review, use, disclosure or distribution is prohibited. If you are not the intended recipient please contact me by reply email and destroy all copies of the original message.

>>>> ECT 090-10 Stubbs - Barkham - draft.doc attachment was removed from this email <<<<
>>>> ECT 090-10 - Stubbs - Barkham -draft.doc attachment was removed from this email <<<<