

**From:** Batten Peter (ShEx)/O=BIS PRODUCTION/OU=EXCHANGE ADMINISTRATIVE GROUP (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/CN=RECIPIENTS/CN=15881F12D716457BB67245288269A7E2-PBATTEN]

**Sent:** Tue 30/09/2014 12:28:49 PM (UTC)

**To:** Swinson MPST [GRO] Callard Richard (ShEx [GRO])

**Cc:** Hamilton Alexander (Communications [GRO]) Fletcher Joanna (Communications [GRO]) McInnes Tim (ShEx [GRO]) Lidbetter Katrina (ShEx [GRO]) Baugh James (ShEx [GRO]) Lambert Leonie (ShEx [GRO]) Cable MPST [GRO]

**Subject:** RE: POL and reports on IT

Dear Alysa

In answering Jo's question it may be useful to clarify what is meant by the term 'case report' and the report that Second Sight has produced that was leaked to some media outlets.

As part of the Working Group process, both Second Sight and POL produce 'case reports' on the submissions made by individual applicants. These case reports are specific to the individuals and are intended to aid the mediator in the event that the Working Group recommends that the case go to mediation. Tony Hooper's role as Chair of the Working Group is to ensure that applicants' cases can progress through the scheme as smoothly and quickly as possible. Part of this is to ensure that individual cases are well researched, appropriately evidenced and objective before they are put to the Working Group for consideration, and this has, on occasion led to him requesting that some case reports be re-written (please note that this information is strictly confidential and must not be released as it would risk prejudicing the operation of the Working Group).

The report that Richard's email referred to has become known as a "thematic report" and the intention had been that it was produced as a generic reference document for use during the mediation process. To be clear, although the Working Group can recommend a case for mediation, it plays no role in that mediation, which is between the applicant and the Post Office as the two involved parties. There is no role for Tony Hooper in the mediation process either. ShEx officials understand that as the mediation process does not involve the Working Group, Tony Hooper has taken the view that the Thematic Report is outside of his remit. The fact that he didn't ask for the thematic report to be re-written does not suggest that he found it credible.

Given the high number of objections that POL has flagged about Second Sight's thematic report (and indeed the JFSA was critical of aspects of the thematic report too), it is perhaps unlikely that any report would satisfy all parties. Instead, POL is producing its own report to inform the mediation process that will sit alongside the Second Sight report. It is our understanding that the JFSA are also producing a briefing note as they too disagreed with elements of the Second Sight report. It is the role of the independent mediator to use the available information to inform the mediation process – not the Working Group.

It is not, at this point in time, appropriate to ask Tony Hooper for more details about his views on a report that is still confidential from the perspective of the Working Group.

I am very happy to discuss the above with you at any point.

Best wishes  
Peter

Peter Batten | Shareholder Executive | Department for Business, Innovation & Skills |  
peter.batten [GRO] | [www.bis.gov.uk](http://www.bis.gov.uk) |

The Department for Business, Innovation & Skills (BIS) is building a dynamic and competitive UK economy by creating the

conditions for business success; promoting innovation, enterprise and science; and giving everyone the skills and opportunities to succeed. To achieve this we will foster world-class universities and promote an open global economy. **BIS - Investing in our future**

---

**From:** Swinson MPST  
**Sent:** 15 September 2014 18:12  
**To:** Callard Richard (ShEx)  
**Cc:** Hamilton Alexander (Communications); Fletcher Joanna (Communications); McInnes Tim (ShEx); Batten Peter (ShEx); Lidbetter Katrina (ShEx); Baugh James (ShEx); Lambert Leonie (ShEx); Cable MPST  
**Subject:** RE: POL and reports on IT

Richard,

The minister was grateful for this briefing and commented that she found it very useful. I would like to add my thanks for the very quick turnaround!

She had one question with regards to the following paragraph: "A number of the reports written by SS in relation to individual cases have been rejected by Tony Hooper, on the basis that the claims are unsubstantiated. In such cases he has tasked SS with re-writing the report. It is not clear why he has not treated this report similarly."

She'd like to know if we can ask him for more details and wondered if the fact that he hadn't asked the report to be rewritten meant that he found the report credible? She'd been keen for further clarification on this. She commented that she found it difficult to just accept POL's analysis of the report without any evidence.

For the future, please keep private office copied in on any news worthy developments. I think we were fairly lucky that this story didn't gain much traction and Jo wasn't asked to comment. It is really important that we are aware of these kinds of events so that Jo feels prepared and sighted on issues within her portfolio.

Please could you submit the answers to Jo's questions for the box on 29 September.

Thanks,  
Alysa

---

**From:** Callard Richard (ShEx)  
**Sent:** 10 September 2014 07:53  
**To:** Swinson MPST  
**Cc:** Hamilton Alexander (Communications); Fletcher Joanna (Communications); McInnes Tim (ShEx); Batten Peter (ShEx); Lidbetter Katrina (ShEx); Baugh James (ShEx); Lambert Leonie (ShEx); Cable MPST  
**Subject:** POL and reports on IT

Alysa, as requested please find a briefing on the Horizon scheme following yesterdays news report.

As you know the POL team is out of the office today so please text my mobile should you need us:

**GRO**

Alex / Jo - I would be grateful if you could update Alysa on the extent to which this has been picked up in today's press and whether you think it has legs. My feeling is that it doesn't but you are more qualified to say. Mark Davies is obviously following this closely.

Thanks

Richard

Sent from my Windows Phone

---

**From:** [Richard](#)  
**Sent:** 10/09/2014 07:43  
**To:** [Callard Richard \(ShEx\)](#)  
**Subject:** Horizon

-----

This email was received from the INTERNET.

Communications via the GSi may be automatically logged, monitored and/or recorded for legal purposes.

-----