From: Johann Appel
 GRO

 To: Andrew Parsons
 GRO

 Subject: RE: Private & Confidential re: Post Office Group Litigation - Request for Documents - SUBJECT TO LEGAL PRIVILEGE

 Date: Fri, 15 Mar 2019 10:42:54 +0000

 Importance: Normal

 Embedded: unnamed(1); unnamed(2)

 Inline-Images: image003.jpg; image004.png; image001.jpg

Andy,

I have attached three earlier e-mail chains relevant to this request. The rest would all be duplicates or correspondence with Lucy Bremner, which I believe you already have.

Hope this helps, but please let me know if you need anything else.

Best regards,

Johann



Johann Appel Head of Internal Audit Ground Floor

20 Finsbury Street LONDON EC2Y 9AQ

GRO

From: Johann Appel
Sent: 15 March 2019 10:20
To: andrew.parsons [_______GRO____]
Subject: FW: Private & Confidential re: Post Office Group Litigation - Request for Documents - SUBJECT
TO LEGAL PRIVILEGE

The e-mail below probably is the best summary of what documentation we have requested from RMG and the reasons why. We have asked for the 2010 E&Y management letter (wherein we believe the issue would have been reported) and/or the ARC minutes, which would have summarised any relevant issues and agreed remedial actions.

I will send the rest of the e-mails in one batch.

Hope this helps.

Best regards,

Johann



Johann Appel Head of Internal Audit Ground Floor 20 Finsbury Street LONDON EC2Y 9AQ

 From: Rodric Williams

 Sent: 12 November 2018 23:39

 To: Luke Ryan

 GRO

 Cc: Johann Appel

 GRO

 Subject: Private & Confidential re: Post Office Group Litigation - Request for Documents - SUBJECT TO LEGAL PRIVILEGE

<u>Private & Confidential - SUBJECT TO LEGAL PRIVILEGE - Sent in Connection with the Post</u> <u>Office Group Litigation</u>

Luke (cc'ing Johann Appel, Post Office Head of Internal Audit),

Following our telephone call on Friday, Post Office Ltd is trying to locate:

a 2010 Ernst & Young management letter; and/or

Royal Mail Group Audit Committee or Audit, Risk & Compliance Committee (ARC) minutes for 2010/2011.

These audit-related documents are sought to assist our preparations for the Post Office Group Litigation "Horizon Issues" trial. That trial will take place in March 2019 to determine (primarily on expert evidence) technical issues concerning the Horizon IT system used to record transactions in Post Office branches.

By way of context:

- In his report filed on 16 October 2018, the Claimants' expert Jason Coyne refers to issues with Credence (a back office accounting system which uses Horizon data) to support his conclusion that Horizon may not be reliable.
- The Credence issues are mentioned in EY's 2011 management letter (disclosed in the Group Litigation) and concern weak change controls and a lack of documentation to approve fixes and patches.
- To address the Credence issues, EY recommended that Post Office require its IT provider Logica to segregate the roles of developer and implementer, maintain complete and accurate records of any changes, and periodically audit the achievement of service level agreements.
- EY's 2011 management letter notes that in 2010 Post Office management stated that Logica had been asked to comply with EY's recommendations and ensure appropriate role separation and that further work would be carried out on this, hence our request for the 2010 EY management letter.
- The 2011 EY management letter did not however comment on whether the issues had been fully addressed as this particular issue was not within scope.
- We are therefore trying to determine whether any other audit-related documents disclose whether these issues were addressed and if so how, hence our request for Royal Mail Group Audit Committee or Audit, Risk & Compliance Committee (ARC) minutes for 2010/2011 which may address this issue.

I hope that clarifies our request. Please let me know if not.

We are unfortunately running on a very tight timetable, so any prompt attention you could provide to this would be very much appreciated so that if appropriate, disclosure can be made as soon as possible this week. I do of course apologise for the short notice.

Please let me know if you would like to discuss or require anything further.

With thanks and kind regards, Rodric



Rodric Williams Head of Legal - Dispute Resolution & Brand 20 Finsbury Street

London EC2Y 9AQ
T: GRO

2017 Winner of the Global Postal Award for Customer Experience

This email and any attachments are confidential and intended for the addressee only. If you are not the named recipient, you must not use, disclose, reproduce, copy or distribute the contents of this communication. If you have received this in error, please contact the sender by reply email and then delete this email from your system. Any views or opinions expressed within this email are solely those of the sender, unless otherwise specifically stated.

POST OFFICE LIMITED is registered in England and Wales no 2154540. Registered Office: Finsbury Dials, 20 Finsbury Street, London EC2Y 9AQ.

"Post Office Limited is committed to protecting your privacy. Information about how we do this can be found on our website at <u>www.postoffice.co.uk/privacy</u>"