

Page 1 of 2

**Martyn Mitchell**

---

**From:** Martyn Mitchell  
**Sent:** 02 November 2010 09:25  
**To:** Jason G Collins  
**Cc:** Nigel Allen  
**Subject:** FW: Mrs Stubbs - Barkham 212/939

Jason

Are you able to confirm that this case is going to be investigated?

Regards, Martyn

Former Sub-postmasters Accounting Team  
2nd Floor West, No. 1 Future Walk,  
Chesterfield S49 1PF

Postline: **GRO**, STD **GRO**  
External Email: **GRO**

---

**From:** Nigel Allen  
**Sent:** 21 October 2010 12:27  
**To:** Martyn Mitchell; Jason G Collins  
**Subject:** RE: Mrs Stubbs - Barkham 212/939

Martyn

The spmr is actually out of contract now as she had submitted her resignation before she was suspended. She is alleging that the loss has been caused by the Horizon system and I am currently awaiting a decision from Jason Collins as to whether this is going to be investigated.

Jason

Have you any news on this?

Thanks

Regards

**Nigel Allen**

Contracts Advisor - Central Southern England

**Post Office Ltd - Network Support**

Upper Floors, The Markets Crown Office, 6-12 New York Street, Leeds, LS2 7DZ

Mobex: **GRO****GRO****GRO**

**Confidential Information:** This e-mail message is for the sole use of the intended recipient (s) and may contain confidential and privileged information. Any unauthorised review, use, disclosure or distribution is prohibited. If you are not the intended recipient, please contact me by reply e-mail and destroy all copies of the original message.

---

**From:** Martyn Mitchell  
**Sent:** 20 October 2010 09:17  
**To:** Nigel Allen  
**Subject:** FW: Mrs Stubbs - Barkham 212/939

02/11/2010

239

BARKHAM 212939- E MAIL CHAIN

From: Mike Wilcox Fri 18/2/11 12:47

Just received the HORIZON data and will send it out to her next week.

To be honest there is no evidence of any criminal activity although the losses are suspicious.

We need to see if she comes back on any problems with the data but I will be looking at closing the case from a criminal point of view.

Regards

*Mike Wilcox*

Security Operations

Post Office Ltd

: Security Suite, Plymouth Mail Centre, Breakwater Road PLYMOUTH PL9 7XX

GRO Post-line: GRO ) Fax: GRO  
Mobex: 5  
GRO

**Confidential Information**

*This email message is for the sole use of the intended recipient(s) and may contain confidential and privileged information. Any unauthorised review, use, disclosure or distribution is prohibited. If you are not the intended recipient please contact me by reply email and destroy all copies of the original message.*

Thanks Nigel.

Kind regards

Emily Springford  
Principal Lawyer - Dispute Resolution  
Postline  
Mobex: GRO

Third Floor, 100 Victoria Embankment  
London EC4Y 0HQ

---

**From:** Nigel Allen  
**Sent:** 18 February 2011 12:44  
**To:** Mike Wilcox  
**Cc:** Jason G Collins; Lin Norbury; Emily B Springford  
**Subject:** RE: Mrs Stubbs....Barkham Post Office  
**Importance:** High  
**Sensitivity:** Confidential

Mike

Are you able to update us on the latest position please.

Emily

Have copied you in as I understand this is likely to come your way now that Mandy Talbot has moved to another role.

Thanks

Regards

**Nigel Allen**

Contracts Advisor - Central Southern England

Post Office Ltd - **Network Support**

Upper Floors, The Markets Crown Office, 6-12 New York Street, Leeds, LS2 7DZ



**Confidential Information:** *This e-mail message is for the sole use of the intended recipient(s) and may contain confidential and privileged information. Any unauthorised review, use, disclosure or distribution is prohibited. If you are not the intended recipient, please contact me by reply e-mail and destroy all copies of the original message.*

---

**From:** Mike Wilcox  
**Sent:** 18 January 2011 09:11  
**To:** Lin Norbury; Nigel Allen; Mandy Talbot  
**Cc:** Jason G Collins  
**Subject:** Mrs Stubbs....Barkham Post Office

I met with Mrs Stubbs yesterday and discussed the outstanding debt with her. (This was not a suspect interview under caution).

The £7000 rem shortage on 25<sup>th</sup> May 2010. she was aware of as this was due to the rem being opened and checked by the auditor on the day. Due to a rushed despatch £7000 was left out of the rem was it was resealed. She says that this was sorted out by the auditor on the day and she wasn't aware that she still owed the £8000. I will need to trace the auditor (Rajinder Gihir), and discuss how this amount was disposed of or accounted for.

She is more annoyed at the fact that she thinks she did not get the support from HORIZON regarding checking her figures against the system.

The main point is for the December trading statement when she only opened for about 2 weeks and still lost £9000.

I have agreed to obtain the full data from HORIZON and look at the transactions for that period. I think this may help to convince her that HORIZON is ok and it may be that someone has taken the money.

It doesn't help that someone in her village used to help in designing HORIZON and has suggested that HORIZON is not perfect.

She knows she owes for the office removal (£3400 I think) and says she will repay when the office is sold.

Will update you later unless you wish to discuss .

Regards

*Mike Wilcox*

Fraud Strand  
Post Office Ltd, National Security Team

: Security Suite, Plymouth Mall Centre, Breakwater Road PLYMOUTH PL9 7XX

: **GRO** (Post-lin: **GRO** Fax: **GRO**  
: (Mobex: **GRO**

**GRO**

**Confidential Information**

*This email message is for the sole use of the intended recipient(s) and may contain confidential and privileged information. Any unauthorised review, use, disclosure or distribution is prohibited. If you are not the intended recipient please contact me by reply email and destroy all copies of the original message.*

**From:** Mike Wilcox  
**Sent:** 11 January 2011 09:42  
**To:** Lin Norbury  
**Subject:** RE: Mrs Stubbs - Barkham 212/939

Lin

I am meeting with Mrs Stubbs on Monday 17<sup>th</sup> at Wokingham.

Regards



*Mike Wilcox*

Fraud Strand  
Post Office Ltd, National Security Team

Security Suite, Plymouth Mail Centre, Breakwater Road PLYMOUTH PL9 7XX

GRO

(Post-line:

GRO

Fax: 0

GRO

(Mobex: 5

GRO

**Confidential Information**

*This email message is for the sole use of the intended recipient(s) and may contain confidential and privileged information. Any unauthorised review, use, disclosure or distribution is prohibited. If you are not the intended recipient please contact me by reply email and destroy all copies of the original message.*

---

**From:** Lin Norbury  
**Sent:** 10 December 2010 17:51  
**To:** Mike Wilcox  
**Cc:** Jason G Collins  
**Subject:** RE: Mrs Stubbs - Barkham 212/939

Thanks, Mike.  
I have asked Nigel to come back to you with the address details. Can you let me know what date you eventually book to see her.  
Thanks  
Lin

Lin Norbury  
National Contract Manager - South  
Post Office Ltd - Network Support

2<sup>nd</sup> Floor Post Office Ltd The Markets 6-16 New York Street LEEDS LS2 7DZ



GRO

Mobex: GRO



GRO

---

**From:** Mike Wilcox  
**Sent:** 10 December 2010 10:47  
**To:** Lin Norbury  
**Cc:** Jason G Collins  
**Subject:** RE: Mrs Stubbs - Barkham 212/939

Lin

After an initial look at the paperwork and then a few questions to Fujitsu, at the moment there is no reason to doubt the integrity of the system

I consider that the way to progress this case is for me to arrange to meet with Mrs Stubbs and find out why she thinks the system is at fault and what evidence she has to support these allegations.

This will not be a tape recorded interview under caution (at this time) but just a fact finding interview / statement.

I cannot see this happening until after Christmas due to court commitments but I will contact her and let her know I am dealing with the case and will need to meet with her.

Do you know if her address is still the Post Office@ one?

Regards

*Mike Wilcox*

Fraud Strand  
Post Office Ltd, National Security Team

---

Security, Plymouth Mail Centre, Breakwater Road PLYMOUTH PL9 7XX

GRO	(Post-line	GRO	) Fax:	GRO
	(Mobex	GRO		
GRO				

**Confidential Information**

*This email message is for the sole use of the intended recipient(s) and may contain confidential and privileged information. Any unauthorised review, use, disclosure or distribution is prohibited. If you are not the intended recipient please contact me by reply email and destroy all copies of the original message.*

FROM: Jason Collins Fri 26/11/10 @ 10:47

All,

In review of the information by Mike Wilcox he came across some transactional information on the Fujitsu data requested, that needs clarification direct from Fujitsu. I have forwarded a request on Mike behalf to Fujitsu asking them to check and clarify the data provided, and it is expected that we should get a response early next week. The anomaly identified in the data relates to transactions appearing out of normal sequencing and our initial view is that this is just a potential data filtering issue and nothing untoward, but we do need it to be clarified before we can decide what steps we might wish to consider. This clearly is a limiting factor in regards to timeliness to progress from our side, but please be assured we are doing what we can to try to get the answers as quick as possible.

Regards,

Jason

---

**From:** Nigel Allen  
**Sent:** 24 November 2010 15:50  
**To:** Martyn Mitchell  
**Cc:** Lin Norbury; Jason G Collins  
**Subject:** RE: Mrs Stubbs - Barkham 212/939

Martyn

We have not yet had a decision from Security. Lin Norbury has recently chased this up with Jason Collins.

Regards

**Nigel Allen**

Contracts Advisor - Central Southern England  
Post Office Ltd - **Network Support**  
Upper Floors, The Markets Crown Office, 6-12 New York Street, Leeds, LS2 7DZ



Mobex: **GRO**



**GRO**



**GRO**

**Confidential Information:** *This e-mail message is for the sole use of the intended recipient (s) and may contain confidential and privileged information. Any unauthorised review, use, disclosure or distribution is prohibited. If you are not the intended recipient, please contact me by reply e-mail and destroy all copies of the original message.*

---

**From:** Martyn Mitchell  
**Sent:** 24 November 2010 08:36

**To:** Nigel Allen  
**Subject:** RE: Mrs Stubbs - Barkham 212/939

Nigel

Did you ever find out whether this case was going to be investigated?

Regards, Martyn

Former Sub-postmasters Accounting Team  
2nd Floor West, No. 1 Future Walk,  
Chesterfield S49 1PF

Postline **GRO** STD **GRO**  
External Email M **GRO**


---

**From:** Lin Norbury  
**Sent:** 22 November 2010 00:27  
**To:** Jason G Collins  
**Cc:** Mike Wilcox; Nigel Allen  
**Subject:** RE: Mrs Stubbs - Barkham 212/939

Jason / Mike  
Sorry to have to chase, but any update yet? This Subpmr has been suspended since early June, still owes POL in excess of £28k and we really need to be moving the case along. Would appreciate an update and in the absence of that an estimate of timescales please.  
Thanks  
Lin

Lin Norbury  
National Contract Manager - South  
Post Office Ltd - Network Support

2<sup>nd</sup> Floor Post Office Ltd The Markets 6 16 New York Street LEEDS LS2 7DZ

 **GRO**  
Mobex **GRO**

 **GRO**

---

**From:** Mike Wilcox  
**Sent:** 29 October 2010 13:53  
**To:** Lin Norbury  
**Cc:** Jason G Collins  
**Subject:** FW: Mrs Stubbs - Barkham 212/939

Lin

Sent this last week sorry didn't copy you in.  
Jason any further comments re workloads time etc?

Regards

*Mike Wilcox*

Fraud Strand  
Post Office Ltd, National Security Team

---

Security Suite, Plymouth Mail Centre, Breakwater Road PLYMOUTH PL9 7XX

**GRO** (Post-line: **GRO**) Fax: **GRO**  
(Mobex: **GRO**)  
**GRO**

---

**Confidential Information**

*This email message is for the sole use of the intended recipient(s) and may contain confidential and privileged information. Any unauthorised review, use, disclosure or distribution is prohibited. If you are not the intended recipient please contact me by reply email and destroy all copies of the original message.*

---

**From:** Mike Wilcox  
**Sent:** 25 October 2010 13:55  
**To:** Jason G Collins  
**Cc:** Nigel Allen  
**Subject:** RE: Mrs Stubbs - Barkham 212/939

Nigel

I have referred some queries to Fujitsu regarding the evidence in this case, so cannot give a definitive answer until I receive a reply.

A couple of points which may help in the meantime, is that I have confirmed that all the rems have been received so there doesn't seem to be a problem there  
When she says that the auditor did a cash check at 09:00 and 13.00 on the 10<sup>th</sup> May there is no HORIZON record of this so cannot say either way however she had been serving customers before 09 00 and the last customer at 09 00 was a withdrawal of £190 71 (£190 is the shortage she is disputing)

Sorry I can't be any more specific at the moment

Regards

*Mike Wilcox*

Fraud Strand  
Post Office Ltd, National Security Team

: Security Suite, Plymouth Mail Centre, Breakwater Road PLYMOUTH PL9 7XX

GRO (Post-line: GRO) Fax: GRO  
(Mobex: GRO)  
GRO

**Confidential Information**

*This email message is for the sole use of the intended recipient(s) and may contain confidential and privileged information. Any unauthorised review, use, disclosure or distribution is prohibited. If you are not the intended recipient please contact me by reply email and destroy all copies of the original message.*

---

**From:** Jason G Collins  
**Sent:** 21 October 2010 14:56  
**To:** Mike Wilcox  
**Subject:** FW: Mrs Stubbs - Barkham 212/939

Mike,

FYI, advise as and when you can please

Regards,

Jason

---

**From:** Nigel Allen  
**Sent:** 21 October 2010 12:27  
**To:** Martyn Mitchell; Jason G Collins  
**Subject:** RE: Mrs Stubbs - Barkham 212/939

Martyn

The spmr is actually out of contract now as she had submitted her resignation before she was suspended.

She is alleging that the loss has been caused by the Horizon system and I am currently awaiting a decision from Jason Collins as to whether this is going to be investigated

Jason

Have you any news on this?

Thanks

Regards

**Nigel Allen**

Contracts Advisor - Central Southern England

Post Office Ltd - **Network Support**

Upper Floors, The Markets Crown Office, 6-12 New York Street, Leeds, LS2 7DZ



Mobex: **GRO**



**GRO**



**GRO**

**Confidential Information:** This e-mail message is for the sole use of the intended recipient (s) and may contain confidential and privileged information. Any unauthorised review, use, disclosure or distribution is prohibited. If you are not the intended recipient, please contact me by reply e-mail and destroy all copies of the original message.

---

**From:** Martyn Mitchell

**Sent:** 20 October 2010 09:17

**To:** Nigel Allen

**Subject:** FW: Mrs Stubbs - Barkham 212/939

Nigel

Could you please provide a brief update on how this suspension case is progressing?

Regards, Martyn

Former Sub-postmasters Accounting Team  
2nd Floor West, No 1 Future Walk,  
Chesterfield S49 1PF

Postline **GRO** STD **GRO**

External Email **GRO**

---

**From:** Carol Ballan

**Sent:** 05 October 2010 15:07

**To:** Martyn Mitchell; Nigel Allen

**Subject:** RE: Mrs Stubbs - Barkham 212/939

Martyn this is one of Nigels' branches I was going to interview an applicant not Mrs Stubbs Nigel may be able to let you know where he is with the case

Regards

Carol

**From:** Martyn Mitchell  
**Sent:** 05 October 2010 14:40  
**To:** Carol Ballan  
**Subject:** Mrs Stubbs - Barkham 212/939

Carol

The last entry on my file shows that Paul Dann gave you the outstanding balance on this account at the beginning of August because you were going to interview Mrs Stubbs on the 24<sup>th</sup>. Could you please let me know the outcome of the interview and whether any action is still being taken? The debt remains at £28,829.05.

Regards, Martyn

Former Sub-postmasters Accounting Team  
2nd Floor West, No. 1 Future Walk,  
Chesterfield S49 1PF

Postline: 

GRO	TD	GRO
-----	----	-----

  
External Email: 

GRO
-----

**From: Jason Collins Fri 8/10/10 @ 9:59**

Mark/Nigel

I've passed on the details to Mike Wilcox, who will review the information over the course of the next week or so in line with his own operational workloads. I've asked that he report back his findings in regards to the matter and we can then make an informed decision on any potential grounds for an investigation case.

Regards,

Jason

---

**From:** Mark Dinsdale  
**Sent:** 07 October 2010 19:41  
**To:** Nigel Allen  
**Cc:** Jason G Collins; Iain Murphy; Jane M Owen  
**Subject:** RE: ARQ requests - Barkham Post Office 212939

Nigel,

Jason is currently having one of his team review this to consider what steps can be taken. One of us will therefore be in touch very shortly.

Regards  
Mark Dinsdale

---

**From:** Mark Dinsdale  
**Sent:** 27 September 2010 13:23  
**To:** Nigel Allen



**Cc:** Jason G Collins; Iain Murphy  
**Subject:** FW: ARQ requests - Barkham Post Office 212939

Nigel, this unfortunately is not so straight forward.

I understand Jason asked you a number of questions in an email 21 June and stated that with the information to hand at that time that they could not engage from an investigation perspective. As a result of that email, I suspect this is why the ARQ was requested by the live service desk and the information was provided to enable further checks.

In light that the information still doesn't answer the questions posed, I have asked Jason and Iain to consider how this is taken forward, i.e. we raise a case or not, and shall return a response as soon as I can.

Regards  
Mark Dinsdale

---

**From:** Iain Murphy  
**Sent:** 21 September 2010 08:25  
**To:** Mark Dinsdale  
**Cc:** Jason G Collins  
**Subject:** RE: ARQ requests - Barkham Post Office 212939

Mark,

Please pass to Jason to have a look at.

Thanks,

Iain

---

**From:** Mark Dinsdale  
**Sent:** 17 September 2010 20:24  
**To:** Iain Murphy  
**Subject:** FW: ARQ requests - Barkham Post Office 212939  
**Importance:** High

Iain, sorry I run out of time to ring you and I'm off on Monday

I think in a nut shell, I think we need to decide if one of the investigators who have the knowledge to sit and sift through what has been provided along with the ARQ and go and see what the ex-spmr is holding. I think this is going to be a very onerous task but I can't see how we can let this one go considering she is questioning the integrity of Horizon

How do you want me to deal with this one? Jason did offer some advice, but I think it has grown to be a more serious problem now with what has subsequently come to light, i.e. auditor corroborating the spmr's account

Regards  
Mark

---

**From:** Mark Dinsdale  
**Sent:** 14 September 2010 12:05  
**To:** Andy Hayward; Iain Murphy

**Subject:** FW: ARQ requests - Barkham Post Office 212939  
**Importance:** High

Andy / Iain

This is quickly turning into a bit of a problem.

This is a potential fraud where losses occurred when a spmr moved into a portacabin, but ceased the moment she was suspended and somebody else run the office. She did have a clerk, so it could transpire she has nothing to do with the losses. We are talking about £28k, a potential flag case, with MP's involved. The spmr is questioning the integrity of Horizon.

It looks like contracts/Chesterfield dealt with this themselves, although did speak to investigations. Once I received the paper work from Nigel, it looks like there are numerous activities that have taken place, including somebody sending in an auditor who sat with the spmr for half a day which clearly made matters worse.

I don't know why we were never approached to deal with this as a criminal investigation in the first instance, perhaps it was felt that it wasn't at the time. The auditor supposedly witness all transactions for half a day and witness Horizon being short, thereby corroborating her account and also now a potential witness for her (when in fact clearly he can not have witnessed everything), and also begs the question as to why it was left 'high and dry' at the time and Credence was not checked etc.

This now leaves us in a very difficult situation. With the spmr writing letters to Dave Smith, her MP and no doubt countless other people, this is high profile. She has also joined the spmr's fight to question the integrity of Horizon. As it stands no investigation has taken place by us, various intervention has probably complicated this, yet because it is a question of Horizon integrity we can't simply ignore it, or drop it, but probably have some difficult questions ahead of us in terms of why has it taken so long for us to consider this criminal if this is the course of action we take.

Regards  
Mark

---

**From:** Nigel Allen  
**Sent:** 13 September 2010 12:47  
**To:** Mark Dinsdale; Duty Manager; Jane M Owen; Emma Langfield  
**Cc:** Lin Norbury  
**Subject:** RE: ARQ requests - Barkham Post Office 212939  
**Importance:** High

Mark

What we're trying to determine here is whether there is any discrepancy between the information sent in to the Live Service team by the spmr, Mrs Stubbs, and what the Horizon system is showing. She is alleging that her losses of £28k+ are due to problems with the Horizon system after it was relocated into a portacabin last October whilst the branch was being renovated.

Can you advise whether a case is being raised on this? Given the fact that we have not experienced similar losses with the temporary spmr who was appointed after Mrs Stubbs was suspended and the same Horizon kit is being used, shouldn't we be asking her some very searching questions under caution?

Also need to be aware that this case is very high profile with several flag cases already and the MP is involved. I understand that Mrs Stubbs has also joined up with Justice for

Postmasters' who are involved with a court case alleging losses caused by Horizon. Mandy Talbot in Legal Services has said it is absolutely essential that we have the necessary information from Fujitsu to support our case in pursuing the outstanding debt. Mrs Stubbs still has some further information that she alleges will support her case but is refusing to let it out of her sight but this may need to be checked against Fujitsu data.

An added complication here is that Mrs Stubbs resigned in May before being suspended in June and her notice has therefore now expired. An applicant has been interviewed and offered the appointment but we are concerned at allowing a transfer to go ahead whilst this debt remains outstanding. Advice is being sought from Legal on this.

Please advise how this is now to be taken forward.

Regards

**Nigel Allen**

Contracts Advisor - Central Southern England

Post Office Ltd - **Network Support**

Upper Floors, The Markets Crown Office, 6-12 New York Street, Leeds, LS2 7DZ



Mobex:

GRO



GRO



GRO

**Confidential Information:** *This e-mail message is for the sole use of the intended recipient (s) and may contain confidential and privileged information. Any unauthorised review, use, disclosure or distribution is prohibited. If you are not the intended recipient, please contact me by reply e-mail and destroy all copies of the original message.*

---

**From:** Mark Dinsdale

**Sent:** 10 September 2010 16:57

**To:** Nigel Allen; Duty Manager; Jane M Owen; Emma Langfield

**Subject:** RE: ARQ requests - Barkham Post Office 212939

Nigel, I've extracted the relevant detail for you. I'm not actually sure what's expected to be found in this, because these just illustrate what was transacted into Horizon. These highlights all cash declarations and remittances as requested. Hopefully this answers all the questions posed.

Where do you want the paper work sending that was sent to me

Regards

Mark Dinsdale

**04 January 2010 and 05 January 2010**

Please provide system logs for all pouch preparations along with remittances inward and outward and any associated reversals on this, please confirm ONCH/Cash for 04/01/2010 and 05/01/2010.

05-Jan-2010	12:34:14	44-212939-1-917197-1	44-212939-1-917197-2	RODP	6509	1	18000	1
05-Jan-2010	09:17:31	44-212939-1-916827-2	44-212939-1-916827-5	ROSP	5610	-1	-18000	
05-Jan-2010	12:34:14	44-212939-1-917197-1	44-212939-1-917197-3	RODP	6286	-1	-18000	

04-Jan-2010	17:36:21	AWA001	AA	DeclareCash Total £30275.63 For SU AA Till 01				Declaration Complete
05-Jan-2010	17:39:31	PST001	AA	DeclareCash Total £8940.20 For SU AA Till 01				Declaration Complete

**09 April 2010**

Please provide system logs for all pouch preparations along with remittances inward and outward and any associated reversals on this, please confirm ONCH/Cash for 09 April 2010.

Please provide system logs for transactions and events undertaken on horizon between 00:01 - 10:00 on the same day 09 April 2010

See row 46-49 on attachment 9 Apr 10 for remittances, i.e. £27k, £17k + £10k

See row 65 on attachment Events 9 Apr 10, £11,920.47 cash dec.

PST001	AA	09-Apr-2010	08:06:12	44-212939-1-1006117-2	44-212939-1-1006117-3	ROSP	1	85
PST001	AA	09-Apr-2010	08:06:12	44-212939-1-1006117-2	44-212939-1-1006117-4	ROSP	5610	-1
PST001	AA	09-Apr-2010	08:08:53	44-212939-1-1006124-2	44-212939-1-1006124-3	ROSP	1	10
PST001	AA	09-Apr-2010	08:08:53	44-212939-1-1006124-2	44-212939-1-1006124-4	ROSP	5610	-1

09-Apr-2010	16:43:28	PST001	AA	DeclareCash Total £11920.47 For SU AA Till 01				Declar
-------------	----------	--------	----	---	--	--	--	--------

**18 May 2010**

Please provide system log for any ONCH/Cash declarations made by the branch

See row

18-May-2010	16:31:53	PST001	AA	DeclareCash Total £7767.24 For SU AA Till 01				De
-------------	----------	--------	----	--	--	--	--	----

PST002	AA	18-May-2010	07:58:54	44-212939-2-2543824-2	44-212939-2-2543824-3	ROSP	1	€
PST002	AA	18-May-2010	07:58:54	44-212939-2-2543824-2	44-212939-2-2543824-4	ROSP	1	1
PST002	AA	18-May-2010	07:58:54	44-212939-2-2543824-2	44-212939-2-2543824-5	ROSP	5610	-

AWA001	AA	18-May-2010	08:13:41	44-212939-1-1045328-1	44-212939-1-1045328-2	RODP	6509	-
AWA001	AA	18-May-2010	08:13:41	44-212939-1-1045328-1	44-212939-1-1045328-3	RODP	6286	-

**19 May 2010**

Please provide system log for any ONCH/Cash declarations made by the branch

19-May-2010	07:06:46	PST001	AA	DeclareCash Total £7767.24 For SU AA Till 01				De
19-May-2010	07:58:10	PST001	AA	DeclareCash Total £7767.24 For SU AA Till 01				De
19-May-2010	08:01:23	PST001	AA	DeclareCash Total £13441.30 For SU AA Till 01				De
19-May-2010	12:09:13	PST001	AA	DeclareCash Total £13441.30 For SU AA Till 01				De
19-May-2010	12:17:02	PST001	AA	DeclareCash Total £11699.61 For SU AA Till 01				De
19-May-2010	12:24:10	PST001	AA	DeclareCash Total £11699.61 For SU AA Till 01				De
19-May-2010	15:38:52	PST001	AA	DeclareCash Total £11699.61 For SU AA Till 01				De
19-May-2010	15:40:53	PST001	AA	DeclareStamp Total £4554.04 For SU AA Till 01				De
19-May-2010	15:42:02	PST001	AA	DeclareCurrency Total £1330.00 For SU AA Till 01				De

**09 May 2010**

Please provide system log for any ONCH/Cash declarations made by the branch

Nil – this is a Sunday

**28 May 2010**

Please provide system log for all pouch preparations along with remittances inward and outward with any associated reversals.

28-May-2010	12:06:31	AWA001	AA	DeclareCash Total £6429.33 For SU AA Till 01				De
28-May-2010	13:12:38	PST001	AA	DeclareCash Total £6429.33 For SU AA Till 01				De
28-May-2010	16:33:18	PST001	AA	DeclareCash Total £5567.38 For SU AA Till 01				De

PST002	AA	28-May-2010	08:07:25	44-212939-2-2545896-2	44-212939-2-2545896-3	ROSP	1	10
PST002	AA	28-May-2010	08:07:25	44-212939-2-2545896-2	44-212939-2-2545896-4	ROSP	5610	-1

PST002	AA	28-May-2010	08:18:11	44-212939-2-2545903-2	44-212939-2-2545903-3	ROSP	1	90
PST002	AA	28-May-2010	08:18:11	44-212939-2-2545903-2	44-212939-2-2545903-3	ROSP	1	20



		2010		2545903-2	2545903-4			
PST002	AA	28-May-2010	08:18:11	44-212939-2-2545903-2	44-212939-2-2545903-5	ROSP	1	1
PST002	AA	28-May-2010	08:18:11	44-212939-2-2545903-2	44-212939-2-2545903-6	ROSP	1	1
PST002	AA	28-May-2010	08:18:11	44-212939-2-2545903-2	44-212939-2-2545903-7	ROSP	1	2
PST002	AA	28-May-2010	08:18:11	44-212939-2-2545903-2	44-212939-2-2545903-8	ROSP	5610	-1

**From:** Nigel Allen  
**Sent:** 10 August 2010 08:51  
**To:** Mark Dinsdale; Duty Manager; Jane M Owen  
**Subject:** RE: ARQ requests - Barkham Post Office 212939

Mark

Thanks for the update.  
Once the outcome is known, I will communicate this to Mrs Stubbs although I will be on hols from next week for two weeks so will discuss with Lin Norbury as to whether someone else may need to pick this up in my absence

Regards

**Nigel Allen**  
Contracts Advisor - Central Southern England  
Post Office Ltd - **Network Support**  
Upper Floors, The Markets Crown Office, 6-12 New York Street, Leeds, LS2 7DZ



**Confidential Information:** This e-mail message is for the sole use of the intended recipient(s) and may contain confidential and privileged information. Any unauthorised review, use, disclosure or distribution is prohibited. If you are not the intended recipient, please contact me by reply e-mail and destroy all copies of the original message.

**From:** Mark Dinsdale  
**Sent:** 06 August 2010 17:43  
**To:** Nigel Allen; Duty Manager; Jane M Owen  
**Subject:** RE: ARQ requests - Barkham Post Office 212939

Nigel we are hoping to get the data asap following a delay in getting ARQ s from Fujitsu

I'm on A/L now for 2 weeks so Jane will fire this over when she gets it Obviously we can't hand the data to the SPMR will you be handling disclosing what we are able to

Cheers  
Mark

---

**From:** Nigel Allen  
**Sent:** 28 July 2010 10:08  
**To:** Duty Manager; Mark Dinsdale; Jane M Owen  
**Subject:** RE: ARQ requests - Barkham Post Office 212939  
**Importance:** High

Dear All

Do we have any news on this yet please?  
As you know, this has been the subject of several Flag Cases and the local MP is also taking an active interest.

Thanks  
Regards

---

**Nigel Allen**  
Contracts Advisor - Central Southern England  
Post Office Ltd – **Network Support**  
Upper Floors, The Markets Crown Office, 6-12 New York Street, Leeds, LS2 7DZ



Mobex:

GRO

GRO

GRO

**Confidential Information:** *This e-mail message is for the sole use of the intended recipient (s) and may contain confidential and privileged information. Any unauthorised review, use, disclosure or distribution is prohibited. If you are not the intended recipient, please contact me by reply e-mail and destroy all copies of the original message.*

---

**From:** Emma Langfield **On Behalf Of** Duty Manager  
**Sent:** 12 July 2010 12:40  
**To:** Mark Dinsdale; Jane M Owen  
**Cc:** Nigel Allen  
**Subject:** Re: ARQ requests - Barkham Post Office 212939

Afternoon Mark

Have Fujitsu provided timescales for provision of the requests below.

Many thanks  
Emma

Live Service Team  
Service Delivery

Post Office Limited

**GRO**

**From:** Nigel Allen  
**Sent:** 28 June 2010 22:49  
**To:** Mark Dinsdale  
**Cc:** Jason G Collins; Lin Norbury; Michele Graves  
**Subject:** Re: Fw: Barkham PO 212939 - request from Live Service Team for archived data  
**Importance:** High

Mark

This branch has a very large loss which the spmr is attributing to Horizon. We have already had one Flag case on this and this will remain high profile so the data does need to be retrieved.

Many thanks

Regards

**Nigel Allen**

Contracts Advisor - South West England  
Post Office Ltd - **Network Support**  
NSA Maidstone, Royal Mail Building, 1<sup>st</sup> Floor Admin Block, 98 Sandling Road, Maidstone,  
Kent. ME14 1AA



Mobex: **GRO**



**GRO**



**GRO**

**Confidential Information:** *This e-mail message is for the sole use of the intended recipient (s) and may contain confidential and privileged information. Any unauthorised review, use, disclosure or distribution is prohibited. If you are not the intended recipient, please contact me by reply e-mail and destroy all copies of the original message.*

Mark Dinsdale

Mark Dinsdale To: Nigel Allen/e/POSTOFFICE  
cc: Lin Norbury/e/POSTOFFICE  
24/06/2010 17:37 , Michele  
**GRO**  
**GRO**



Graves/e/POSTOFFICE [GRO]  
Jason G Collins/e/POSTOFFICE  
Subject: Re: Fw: Barkham PO 212939 -  
request from Live Service Team for

archived data

Nigel, no probs with requesting data from Fujitsu, but it will take around 3 weeks.  
Has Jason agreed to take this case on, because we don't hand over Horizon logs to a  
spmr. It needs an expert to understand what it says, and usually this requires one of  
the investigators.

I'll give Jason a call in the morning, then I will raise an ARQ from Fujitsu

Is this for our benefit, as there is a cost attached to ARQ requests, we do get a supply  
free of charge as part of the contract but we usually don't have enough, therefore we  
usually charge the defence lawyers.

---

Mark Dinsdale  
**Security Programme Manager**  
**Security Team, Post Office Ltd**

---

Post Office Ltd, Security Team, Royal Mail, 3rd  
Floor, Clippers House, Clippers Quay, Salford, M50  
3NW

[GRO] 5 Mobex: [GRO] 6 (preferred  
contact method)

[GRO] Postline: [GRO]  
[GRO]

[Post Office HR Help](#)

---

**Confidential Information:**

*This email message is for the sole use of the  
intended recipient(s) and may contain confidential  
and privileged information. Any unauthorised  
review, use, disclosure or distribution is prohibited.  
If you are not the intended recipient please contact  
me by reply email and destroy all copies of the  
original message.*

**To:** Mark Dinsdale/e/POSTOFFICE, Jane M Owen/e/POSTOFFICE  
**cc:** Nigel Allen/e/POSTOFFICE  
**Hard Copy To:**  
**Hard Copy cc:**

**Date:** 22/06/2010 16:17

**From:** Duty Manager  
**Sent by:** Emma Langfield  
**Subject:** ARQ requests - Barkham Post Office 212939

Afternoon Mark

We are currently in dispute re debts owing by this branch and to bring the matter to a close need to present information which disproves the spmrs assertion that horizon is generating errors. Please see dates and requirements below, could you confirm if Fujitsu will provide via ARQ and whether all requests can be met.

Nigel as discussed I can only request logs for specific queries as the transaction logs in themselves do not amount to evidence.

04 January 2010 and 05 January 2010

Please provide system logs for all pouch preparations along with remittances inward and outward and any associated reversals on this, please confirm ONCH/Cash for 04/01/2010 and 05/01/2010

09 April 2010

Please provide system logs for all pouch preparations along with remittances inward and outward and any associated reversals on this, please confirm ONCH/Cash for 09 April 2010.

Please provide system logs for transactions and events undertaken on horizon between 00:01 - 10:00 on the same day 09 April 2010

18 May 2010

Please provide system log for any ONCH/Cash declarations made by the branch

19 May 2010

Please provide system log for any ONCH/Cash declarations made by the branch

09 May 2010

Please provide system log for any ONCH/Cash declarations made by the branch

28 May 2010

Please provide system log for all pouch preparations along with remittances inward and outward with any associated reversals.

Many thanks  
Emma

Live Service Team  
Service Delivery  
Post Office Limited

GRO

- - - Forwarded by Nigel Allen e POSTOFFICE on 22/06/2010 14:22 - - -

Michele To: Lin  
Graves Norbury/e/POSTOFFICE GRO  
cc: Eunice  
18/06/2010 Kirby/e/POSTOFFICE GRO  
16:07 Sarah  
Howard/e/POSTOFFICE GRO  
Nigel  
Allen/e/POSTOFFICE GRO  
Subject: Re: re reply to Mrs Stubbs -

Barkham PO

Thanks Lin

Have made suggested changes & sent.

If we can encourage Mark Dinsdale to authorise the audit trail, I feel it would be beneficial given the current interest in Horizon from media & MP's.

Rgds

---

Michele Graves  
**Executive Correspondence Manager**  
**Executive Correspondence Team**  
Post Office Limited

---

1st Floor, Bunhill Row Wing, 148 Old Street,  
LONDON, EC1V 9HQ

phone number

GRO

mobile number

GRO

Postline

GRO

GRO  
fax (GRO)

**Confidential Information:**

*This email message is for the sole use of the intended recipient(s) and may contain confidential and privileged information. Any unauthorised review, use, disclosure or distribution is prohibited. If you are not the intended recipient please contact me by reply email and destroy all copies of the original message.*

Lin Norbury

Lin To: Michele  
Norbury Graves/e/POSTOFFICE GRO  
cc: Eunice  
18/06/2010 Kirby/e/POSTOFFICE GRO  
15:22 Sarah  
Howard/e/POSTOFFICE GRO  
Nigel  
Allen/e/POSTOFFICE GRO E  
Subject: Re: re reply to Mrs Studds

Barkham PO

Michele  
I have changed it slightly.

In terms of the points raised we do have a report from the auditor but it is probably not detailed enough to cover all the points, so we will probably need to go back on this as part of the contractual case. In terms of the audit trail via Horizon we are waiting for Mark Dinsdale to authorise the case as he holds the budget. Nigel has today referred the case to Jason Collins requesting their involvement given the level of losses - I will forward e-mail separately. Need to see where this gets us before we can move the case forward or start to answer her detailed questions.

Lin  
National Contract Manager  
Network Support  
Post Office Ltd

Mobex: GRO Mobile: GRO  
External Email: GRO k  
Michele Graves

Michele  
Graves To: Lin  
Norbury/e/POSTOFFICE GRO  
18/06/2010cc: Eunice  
11:22 Kirby/e/POSTOFFICE GRO  
Sarah  
Howard/e/POSTOFFICE GRO  
Subject: re reply to Mrs Stubbs - Barkham  
PO

Hi Lin

Following our conversation I have prepared the attached draft. See what you think, make any changes and then I will send it out in my name.

Moving forward, can you confirm what your next steps are re the points she has raised. I know you are waiting for the audit trail of the transaction events. Re the comment about the two auditor visits monitoring her work and apparently also having a problem with the figures, are you obtaining a report from the auditor? If this escalates we will need to answer the apparent discrepancies in the figures on his laptop & Horizon.

Finally, when your investigations into the issues she has raised have been completed, will one of your team be writing to Mrs Stubbs or do you want to channel through me? If it comes from your team, can they make reference to the letter to David & that this is the result of investigations into the issues she raised with him. Please advise.

Thanks !

---

Michele Graves  
**Executive Correspondence Manager**  
**Executive Correspondence Team**  
Post Office Limited

---

1st Floor, Bunhill Row Wing, 148 Old Street,  
LONDON, EC1V 9HQ  
phone number GRO Postline: GRO  
GRO  
mobile number GRO  
GRO  
tax GRO

---

**Confidential Information:**

*This email message is for the sole use of the intended recipient(s) and may contain confidential and privileged information. Any unauthorised review, use, disclosure or distribution is prohibited. If you are not the intended recipient please contact me by reply email and destroy all copies of the original message.*

>>>> ECT 090-10 Stubbs - Barkham - draft.doc attachment was removed from this email <<<<  
>>>> ECT 090-10 - Stubbs - Barkham -draft.doc attachment was removed from this em

Redacted

**From:** Nigel Allen [GRO]  
**Sent:** 10 May 2010 15:35  
**To:** Andrew Winn  
**Subject:** Re: Fw: Barkham 212939 - Outstanding losses

Andy

What is this £25k of returned cash on 5 Jan?  
Has this been properly recorded on the Horizon system?  
Was it received back at the Cash Centre?

Regards

---

Nigel Allen

Contracts Advisor - South West England

**Post Office Ltd – Network Support**

NSA Maidstone, Royal Mail Building, 1<sup>st</sup> Floor Admin Block, 98 Sandling Road, Maidstone,  
Kent. ME14 1AA



Mobex:

**GRO****GRO****GRO**

**Confidential Information:** *This e-mail message is for the sole use of the intended recipient (s) and may contain confidential and privileged information. Any unauthorised review, use, disclosure or distribution is prohibited. If you are not the intended recipient, please contact me by reply e-mail and destroy all copies of the original message.*

---

Andrew Winn

Andrew Winn

10/05/2010 09:10

To: Nigel Allen/e/POSTOFFICE

cc:

Subject: Re: Fw: Barkham 212939 - Outstanding

**GRO**

losses

Hi Nigel

We are aware of the problems at this branch. The letter suggests she has done all the checks we (& NBSC) would have suggested. There is not a lot of value I can add as there is nothing recorded that would account for the different losses.

There are no transaction corrections that account for the losses or that should have compensated for them. She has already checked her transactional records and can see nothing so it is unlikely that customers are suddenly going to start alerting us to strange deposits into their accounts.

What may or may not be interesting is a £1K TC issued recently for a cash shortage in a rem to the cash centre. One would have thought with the issues involved that a mistake like this would not have been made without realising. It is possible they did realise once the rem had gone but smacks of carelessness at least.

If there is anything specific to investigate I am happy to. It may be worth getting something in writing from Fujitsu to confirm there is nothing that could have failed to have polled/ software anomalies that will come back to bite us.

Andy  
Nigel Allen



Nigel Allen

10/05/2010 08:26

To: Andrew Winn/e/POSTOFFICE GRO  
NSA HoBD49 GRO Outlet Field  
Support GRO  
cc:  
Subject: Fw: Barkham 212939 - Outstanding losses

Andy

Please see letter below from spmr of the above branch.

We currently have a series of large unexplained losses which the spmr is blaming on Horizon but according to Fujitsu there are no software issues at the branch.

I have discussed this with Lin Norbury and she has suggested I forward this to you for further investigation. A special audit was requested on 29 Apr and I'm just waiting for the date.

Thanks

Nigel Allen/OFS

My email of 29 Apr refers. Any news on the special audit?

Regards

---

Nigel Allen

Contracts Advisor - South West England

Post Office Ltd - Network Support

NSA Maidstone, Royal Mail Building, 1<sup>st</sup> Floor Admin Block, 98 Sandling Road, Maidstone,  
Kent. ME14 1AA

Mobex: GRO



GRO



GRO

**Confidential Information:** This e-mail message is for the sole use of the intended recipient (s) and may contain confidential and privileged information. Any unauthorised review, use, disclosure or distribution is prohibited. If you are not the intended recipient, please contact me by reply e-mail and destroy all copies of the original message.

---

----- Forwarded by Nigel Allen/c/POSTOFFICE on 10/05/2010 08:19 -----

Sent by: Stephen Saville

NSA HoBD49

To: Nigel Allen/e/POSTOFFICE GRO  
cc:

04/05/2010 13:24

Subject: Barkham 212939 - Letter received 04/05/2010

Hi Nigel,

Please find attached a copy of the letter received today from Pam Stubbs at Barkham 212939.

Regards

---

**Stephen Saville**

Barkham Support

**Post Office Ltd - Network**

Upper Floors Markets Crown Office, 6-16 New York Street, Leeds, LS2 7DZ



**GRO**

8 or

**GRO**



None



**GRO**

**Confidential Information:** *This e-mail message is for the sole use of the intended recipient (s) and may contain confidential and privileged information. Any unauthorised review, use, disclosure or distribution is prohibited. If you are not the intended recipient, please contact me by reply e-mail and destroy all copies of the original message.*

---

>>>> Barkham 212939 - Letter received 04052010.pdf attachment was removed from this email <<<<

**To:** Mark Dinsdale [GRO]; Nigel Allen [GRO]  
**Cc:** Mike Wilcox [GRO]  
**From:** Jason G Collins  
**Sent:** Fri 8 10 2010 8:59:13 AM  
**Subject:** FW: ARQ requests - Barkham Post Office 212939

Mark/Nigel

I've passed on the details to Mike Wilcox, who will review the information over the course of the next week or so in line with his own operational workloads. I've asked that he report back his findings in regards to the matter and we can then make an informed decision on any potential grounds for an investigation case.

Regards,

Jason

---

**From:** Mark Dinsdale  
**Sent:** 07 October 2010 19:41  
**To:** Nigel Allen  
**Cc:** Jason G Collins; Iain Murphy; Jane M Owen  
**Subject:** RE: ARQ requests - Barkham Post Office 212939

Nigel,

Jason is currently having one of his team review this to consider what steps can be taken. One of us will therefore be in touch very shortly.

Regards  
Mark Dinsdale

---

**From:** Mark Dinsdale  
**Sent:** 27 September 2010 13:23  
**To:** Nigel Allen  
**Cc:** Jason G Collins; Iain Murphy  
**Subject:** FW: ARQ requests - Barkham Post Office 212939

Nigel, this unfortunately is not so straight forward.

I understand Jason asked you a number of questions in an email 21 June and stated that with the information to hand at that time that they could not engage from an investigation perspective. As a result of that email, I suspect this is why the ARQ was requested by a live service desk and the information was provided to enable further checks.

In light that the information still doesn't answer the questions posed, I have asked Jason and Iain to consider how this is taken forward, i.e. we raise a case or not, and shall return a response as soon as I can.

Regards  
Mark Dinsdale

---

**From:** Iain Murphy  
**Sent:** 21 September 2010 08:25  
**To:** Mark Dinsdale  
**Cc:** Jason G Collins  
**Subject:** RE: ARQ requests - Barkham Post Office 212939

Mark,

Please pass to Jason to have a look at.

Thanks,

Iain

**From:** Mark Dinsdale  
**Sent:** 17 September 2010 20:24  
**To:** Iain Murphy  
**Subject:** FW: ARQ requests - Barkham Post Office 212939  
**Importance:** High

Iain, sorry I run out of time to ring you and I'm off on Monday.

I think in a nut shell, I think we need to decide if one of the investigators who have the knowledge to sit and sift through what has been provided along with the ARQ and go and see what the ex-spmr is holding. I think this is going to be a very onerous task, but I can't see how we can let this one go considering she is questioning the integrity of Horizon.

How do you want me to deal with this one? Jason did offer some advice, but I think it has grown to be a more serious problem now with what has subsequently come to light, i.e. auditor corroborating the spmr's account.

Regards  
Mark

---

**From:** Mark Dinsdale  
**Sent:** 14 September 2010 12:05  
**To:** Andy Hayward; Iain Murphy  
**Subject:** FW: ARQ requests - Barkham Post Office 212939  
**Importance:** High

Andy / Iain

This is quickly turning into a bit of a problem.

This is a potential fraud where losses occurred when a spmr moved into a portacabin, but ceased the moment she was suspended and somebody else run the office. She did have a clerk, so it could transpire she has nothing to do with the losses. We are talking about £28k, a potential flag case, with MP's involved. The spmr is questioning the integrity of Horizon.

It looks like contracts/Chesterfield dealt with this themselves, although did speak to investigations. Once I received the paper work from Nigel, it looks like there are numerous activities that have taken place, including somebody sending in an auditor who sat with the spmr for half a day which clearly made matters worse.

I don't know why we were never approached to deal with this as a criminal investigation in the first instance, perhaps it was felt that it wasn't at the time. The auditor supposedly witness all transactions for half a day and witness Horizon being short, thereby corroborating her account and also now a potential witness for her (when in fact clearly he can not have witnessed everything), and also begs the question as to why it was left 'high and dry' at the time and Credence was not checked etc.

This now leaves us in a very difficult situation. With the spmr writing letters to Dave Smith, her MP and no doubt countless other people, this is high profile. She has also joined the spmr's fight to question the integrity of Horizon. As it stands no investigation has taken place by us, various intervention has probably complicated this, yet because it is a question of Horizon integrity we can't simply ignore it, or drop it, but probably have some difficult questions ahead of us in terms of why has it taken so long for us to consider this criminal if this is the course of action we take.

Regards  
Mark

---

**From:** Nigel Allen  
**Sent:** 13 September 2010 12:47  
**To:** Mark Dinsdale; Duty Manager; Jane M Owen; Emma Langfield  
**Cc:** Lin Norbury  
**Subject:** RE: ARQ requests - Barkham Post Office 212939  
**Importance:** High

Mark

What we're trying to determine here is whether there is any discrepancy between the information sent in to the Live Service team by the spmr, Mrs Stubbs, and what the Horizon system is showing. She is alleging that her losses of £28k+ are due to problems with the Horizon system after it was relocated into a portacabin last October whilst the branch was being renovated.

Can you advise whether a case is being raised on this? Given the fact that we have not experienced similar losses with the temporary spmr who was appointed after Mrs Stubbs was suspended and the same Horizon kit is being used, shouldn't we be asking her some very searching questions under caution?

# Redacted

An added complication here is that Mrs Stubbs resigned in May before being suspended in June and her notice has therefore now expired. An applicant has been interviewed and offered the appointment but we are concerned at allowing a transfer to go ahead whilst this debt remains outstanding. Redacted

Please advise how this is now to be taken forward.

Regards

Nigel Allen

Contracts Advisor - Central Southern England

Post Office Ltd – Network Support

Upper Floors, The Markets Crown Office, 6-12 New York Street, Leeds, LS2 7DZ



Mobex: GRO



GRO



GRO

**Confidential Information:** *This e-mail message is for the sole use of the intended recipient (s) and may contain confidential and privileged information. Any unauthorised review, use, disclosure or distribution is prohibited. If you are not the intended recipient, please contact me by reply e-mail and destroy all copies of the original message.*

---

**From:** Mark Dinsdale  
**Sent:** 10 September 2010 16:57  
**To:** Nigel Allen; Duty Manager; Jane M Owen; Emma Langfield  
**Subject:** RE: ARQ requests - Barkham Post Office 212939

Nigel, I've extracted the relevant detail for you. I'm not actually sure what's expected to found in this, because these just illustrate what was transacted into Horizon. These highlights all cash declarations and remittances as requested. Hopefully this answers all the questions posed.

Where do you want the paper work sending that was sent to me.

Regards  
Mark Dinsdale

**04 January 2010 and 05 January 2010**

Please provide system logs for all pouch preparations along with remittances inward and outward and any associated reversals on this, please confirm ONCH/Cash for 04/01/2010 and 05/01/2010.

05-Jan-2010	12:34:14	44-212939-1-917197-1	44-212939-1-917197-2	RODP	6509	1	18000	1		
05-Jan-2010	09:17:31	44-212939-1-916827-2	44-212939-1-916827-5	ROSP	5610	-1	-18000			
05-Jan-2010	12:34:14	44-212939-1-917197-1	44-212939-1-917197-3	RODP	6286	-1	-18000			

04-Jan-2010	17:36:21	AWA001	AA	DeclareCash Total £30275.63 For SU AA Till 01	Declaration Complete
05-Jan-2010	17:39:31	PST001	AA	DeclareCash Total £8940.20 For SU AA Till 01	Declaration Complete

**09 April 2010**

Please provide system logs for all pouch preparations along with remittances inward and outward and any associated reversals on this, please confirm ONCH/Cash for 09 April 2010.

Please provide system logs for transactions and events undertaken on horizon between 00:01 - 10:00 on the same day 09 April 2010

See row 46-49 on attachment 9 Apr 10 for remittances, i.e. £27k, £17k + £10k

See row 65 on attachment Events 9 Apr 10, £11,920.47 cash dec.

PST001	AA	09-Apr-2010	08:06:12	44-212939-1-1006117-2	44-212939-1-1006117-3	ROSP	1	850	17000	
PST001	AA	09-Apr-2010	08:06:12	44-212939-1-1006117-2	44-212939-1-1006117-4	ROSP	5610	-1	-17000	
PST001	AA	09-Apr-2010	08:08:53	44-212939-1-1006124-2	44-212939-1-1006124-3	ROSP	1	1000	10000	
PST001	AA	09-Apr-2010	08:08:53	44-212939-1-1006124-2	44-212939-1-1006124-4	ROSP	5610	-1	-10000	

09-Apr-2010	16:43:28	PST001	AA	DeclareCash Total £11920.47 For SU AA Till 01	Declaration Complete
-------------	----------	--------	----	---	----------------------

**18 May 2010**

Please provide system log for any ONCH/Cash declarations made by the branch

See row

18-May-2010	16:31:53	PST001	AA	DeclareCash Total £7767.24 For SU AA Till 01	Declaration Complete
-------------	----------	--------	----	--	----------------------

PST002	AA	18-May-2010	07:58:54	44-212939-2-2543824-2	44-212939-2-2543824-3	ROSP	1	650	13000	
PST002	AA	18-May-2010	07:58:54	44-212939-2-2543824-2	44-212939-2-2543824-4	ROSP	1	1000	10000	



PST002	AA	18-May-2010	07:58:54	44-212939-2-2543824-2	44-212939-2-2543824-5	ROSP	5610	-1	-23000	
AWA001	AA	18-May-2010	08:13:41	44-212939-1-1045328-1	44-212939-1-1045328-2	RODP	6509	1	23000	1
AWA001	AA	18-May-2010	08:13:41	44-212939-1-1045328-1	44-212939-1-1045328-3	RODP	6286	-1	-23000	

19 May 2010

Please provide system log for any ONCH/Cash declarations made by the branch

19-May-2010	07:06:46	PST001	AA	DeclareCash Total £7767.24 For SU AA Till 01	Declaration Complete
19-May-2010	07:58:10	PST001	AA	DeclareCash Total £7767.24 For SU AA Till 01	Declaration Complete
19-May-2010	08:01:23	PST001	AA	DeclareCash Total £13441.30 For SU AA Till 01	Declaration Complete
19-May-2010	12:09:13	PST001	AA	DeclareCash Total £13441.30 For SU AA Till 01	Declaration Complete
19-May-2010	12:17:02	PST001	AA	DeclareCash Total £11694.61 For SU AA Till 01	Declaration Complete
19-May-2010	12:24:10	PST001	AA	DeclareCash Total £11699.61 For SU AA Till 01	Declaration Complete
19-May-2010	15:38:52	PST001	AA	DeclareCash Total £11699.61 For SU AA Till 01	Declaration Complete
19-May-2010	15:40:53	PST001	AA	DeclareStamp Total £4554.04 For SU AA Till 01	Declaration Complete
19-May-2010	15:42:02	PST001	AA	DeclareCurrency Total £1330.00 For SU AA Till 01	Declaration Complete

09 May 2010

Please provide system log for any ONCH/Cash declarations made by the branch

Nil – this is a Sunday

28 May 2010

Please provide system log for all pouch preparations along with remittances inward and outward with any associated reversals.

28-May-2010	12:06:31	AWA001	AA	DeclareCash Total £6429.33 For SU AA Till 01	Declaration Complete
28-May-2010	13:12:38	PST001	AA	DeclareCash Total £6429.33 For SU AA Till 01	Declaration Complete
28-May-2010	16:33:18	PST001	AA	DeclareCash Total £5567.38 For SU AA Till 01	Declaration Complete

PST002	AA	28-May-2010	08:07:25	44-212939-2-2545896-2	44-212939-2-2545896-3	ROSP	1	1000	20000	
PST002	AA	28-May-2010	08:07:25	44-212939-2-2545896-2	44-212939-2-2545896-4	ROSP	5610	-1	-20000	

PST002	AA	28-May-2010	08:18:11	44-212939-2-2545903-2	44-212939-2-2545903-3	ROSP	1	900	9000	
PST002	AA	28-May-2010	08:18:11	44-212939-2-2545903-2	44-212939-2-2545903-4	ROSP	1	20	400	
PST002	AA	28-May-2010	08:18:11	44-212939-2-2545903-2	44-212939-2-2545903-5	ROSP	1	11	110	
PST002	AA	28-May-2010	08:18:11	44-212939-2-2545903-2	44-212939-2-2545903-6	ROSP	1	19	95	
PST002	AA	28-May-2010	08:18:11	44-212939-2-2545903-2	44-212939-2-2545903-7	ROSP	1	200	1000	
PST002	AA	28-May-2010	08:18:11	44-212939-2-2545903-2	44-212939-2-2545903-8	ROSP	5610	-1	-10605	

**From:** Nigel Allen  
**Sent:** 10 August 2010 08:51  
**To:** Mark Dinsdale; Duty Manager; Jane M Owen  
**Subject:** RE: ARQ requests - Barkham Post Office 212939

Mark

Thanks for the update.

Once the outcome is known, I will communicate this to Mrs Stubbs although I will be on hols from next week for two weeks, so will discuss with Lin Norbury as to whether someone else may need to pick this up in my absence.

Re: .ds

**Nigel Allen**

Contracts Advisor - Central Southern England

**Post Office Ltd – Network Support**

Upper Floors, The Markets Crown Office, 6-12 New York Street, Leeds, LS2 7DZ



Mobex **GRO**



**GRO**



**GRO**

**Confidential Information:** This e-mail message is for the sole use of the intended recipient (s) and may contain confidential and privileged information. Any unauthorised review, use,



*disclosure or distribution is prohibited. If you are not the intended recipient, please contact me by reply e-mail and destroy all copies of the original message.*

---

**From:** Mark Dinsdale  
**Sent:** 06 August 2010 17:43  
**To:** Nigel Allen; Duty Manager; Jane M Owen  
**Subject:** RE: ARQ requests - Barkham Post Office 212939

Nigel, we are hoping to get the data asap following a delay in getting ARQ's from Fujitsu.

I'm on A/L now for 2 weeks, so Jane will fire this over when she gets it. Obviously we can't hand the data to the SPMR, will you be handling disclosing what we are able to.

Cheers  
Mark

---

**From:** Nigel Allen  
**Sent:** 28 July 2010 10:08  
**To:** Duty Manager; Mark Dinsdale; Jane M Owen  
**Subject:** RE: ARQ requests - Barkham Post Office 212939  
**Importance:** High

Dear All

Do we have any news on this yet please?

As you know, this has been the subject of several Flag Cases and the local MP is also taking an active interest.

Thanks  
Regards

Nigel Allen

Contracts Advisor - Central Southern England

Post Office Ltd – Network Support

1st Floor, The Markets Crown Office, 6-12 New York Street, Leeds, LS2 7DZ



Mobex

GRO



GRO



GRO

**Confidential Information:** This e-mail message is for the sole use of the intended recipient (s) and may contain confidential and privileged information. Any unauthorised review, use, disclosure or distribution is prohibited. If you are not the intended recipient, please contact me by reply e-mail and destroy all copies of the original message.

---

**From:** Emma Langfield On Behalf Of Duty Manager  
**Sent:** 12 July 2010 12:40  
**To:** Mark Dinsdale; Jane M Owen

**Cc:** Nigel Allen  
**Subject:** Re: ARQ requests - Barkham Post Office 212939

Afternoon Mark

Have Fujitsu provided timescales for provision of the requests below.

Many thanks  
Emma

Live Service Team  
Service Delivery  
Post Office Limited

**GRO**

**From:** Nigel Allen  
**Sent:** 28 June 2010 22:49  
**To:** Mark Dinsdale  
**Cc:** Jason G Collins; Lin Norbury; Michele Graves  
**Subject:** Re: Fw: Barkham PO 212939 - request from Live Service Team for archived data  
**Importance:** High

Mark

This branch has a very large loss which the spmr is attributing to Horizon. We have already had one Flag case on this and this will remain high profile so the data does need to be retrieved.

Many thanks

Regards

---

**Nigel Allen**

Contracts Advisor - South West England

**Post Office Ltd – Network Support**

NSA Maidstone, Royal Mail Building, 1<sup>st</sup> Floor Admin Block, 98 Sandling Road, Maidstone,  
Kent. ME14 1AA



Mobex:

**GRO**



G

**GRO**



**GRO**

**Confidential Information:** *This e-mail message is for the sole use of the intended recipient (s) and may contain confidential and privileged information. Any unauthorised review, use, disclosure or distribution is prohibited. If you are not the intended recipient, please contact me by reply e-mail and destroy all copies of the original message.*

---

Mark Dinsdale

Mark Dinsdale

24/06/2010 17:37

To: Nigel Allen/e/POSTOFFICE  
cc: Lin Norbury/e/POSTOFFICE  
Michele Graves/e/POSTOFFICE  
Jason G Collins/e/POSTOFFICE  
Subject: Re: Fw: Barkham PO 212939 - request from

**GRO**

Live Service Team for archived data

Nigel, no probs with requesting data from Fujitsu, but it will take around 3 weeks. Has Jason agreed to take this case on, because we don't hand over Horizon logs to a spmr. It needs an expert to understand what it says, and usually this requires one of the investigators.

I'll give Jason a call in the morning, then I will raise an ARQ from Fujitsu

Is this for our benefit, as there is a cost attached to ARQ requests, we do get a supply free of charge as part of the contract but we usually don't have enough, therefore we usually charge the defence lawyers.

---

Mark Dinsdale  
**Security Programme Manager**  
**Security Team, Post Office Ltd**

---

Post Office Ltd, Security Team, Royal Mail, 3rd Floor, Clippers House, Clippers Quay, Salford, M50 3NW

**GRO** \$ Mobex: **GRO** preferred contact method)  
\$ Postline: **GRO**  
**GRO**

[Post Office HR Help](#)

---

**Confidential Information:**

*This email message is for the sole use of the intended recipient(s) and may contain confidential and privileged information. Any unauthorised review, use, disclosure or distribution is prohibited. If you are not the intended recipient please contact me by reply email and destroy all copies of the original message.*

To: Mark Dinsdale/e/POSTOFFICE, Jane M Owen/e/POSTOFFICE  
cc: Nigel Allen/e/POSTOFFICE  
Hard Copy To:  
Hard Copy cc:

Date: 22/06/2010 16:17

From: Duty Manager  
Sent by: Emma Langfield  
Subject: ARQ requests - Barkham Post Office 212939

Afternoon Mark

We are currently in dispute re debts owing by this branch and to bring the matter to a close need to present information which disproves the spmrs assertion that horizon is generating errors. Please see dates and requirements below, could you confirm if Fujitsu will provide via ARQ and whether all requests can be met.

Nigel as discussed I can only request logs for specific queries as the transaction logs in themselves do not amount to evidence.

04 January 2010 and 05 January 2010

Please provide system logs for all pouch preparations along with remittances inward and outward and any associated reversals on this, please confirm ONCH/Cash for 04/01/2010 and 05/01/2010

09 April 2010

Please provide system logs for all pouch preparations along with remittances inward and outward and any associated reversals on this, please confirm ONCH/Cash for 09 April 2010.

Please provide system logs for transactions and events undertaken on horizon between 00:01 - 10:00 on the same day 09 April 2010

18 May 2010

Please provide system log for any ONCH/Cash declarations made by the branch

19 May 2010

Please provide system log for any ONCH/Cash declarations made by the branch

09 May 2010

Please provide system log for any ONCH/Cash declarations made by the branch

28 May 2010

Please provide system log for all pouch preparations along with remittances inward and outward with any associated reversals.

Many thanks  
Emma

Live Service Team  
Service Delivery  
Post Office Limited

**GRO**

----- Forwarded by Nigel Allen/e/POSTOFFICE on 22/06/2010 14:22 -----

Michele Graves

18/06/2010 16:07

To: Lin Norbury/e/POSTOFFICE@  
cc: Eunice Kirby/e/POSTOFFICE@  
Sarah Howard/e/POSTOFFICE@  
Allen/e/POSTOFFICE@  
Subject: Re: re reply to Mrs Stubbs - Barkham

GRO

GRO

PO

Thanks Lin

Have made suggested changes & sent.

If we can encourage Mark Dinsdale to authorise the audit trail, I feel it would be beneficial given the current interest in Horizon from media & MP's.

Rgds

---

Michele Graves  
**Executive Correspondence Manager**  
**Executive Correspondence Team**  
Post Office Limited

---

1st Floor, Bunhill Row Wing, 148 Old Street, LONDON, EC1V 9HQ

phone number GRO postline: 5 GRO  
mobile number GRO  
fax GRO

**Confidential Information:**

*This email message is for the sole use of the intended recipient(s) and may contain confidential and privileged information. Any unauthorised review, use, disclosure or distribution is prohibited. If you are not the intended recipient please contact me by reply email and destroy all copies of the original message.*

Lin Norbury

Lin Norbury  
18/06/2010 15:22

To: Michele Graves/e/POSTOFFICE [GRO]  
cc: Eunice Kirby/e/POSTOFFICE [GRO]  
Sarah Howard/e/POSTOFFICE [GRO] E, Nigel  
Allen/e/POSTOFFICE [GRO]  
Subject: Re: re reply to Mrs Stubbs - Barkham

PO

Michele

I have changed it slightly.

In terms of the points raised we do have a report from the auditor but it is probably not detailed enough to cover all the points, so we will probably need to go back on this as part of the contractual case. In terms of the audit trail via Horizon we are waiting for Mark Dinsdale to authorise the case as he holds the budget.

Nig has today referred the case to Jason Collins requesting their involvement given the level of losses - I will forward e-mail separately. Need to see where this gets us before we can move the case forward or start to answer her detailed questions.

Lin  
National Contract Manager  
Network Support  
Post Office Ltd

Mobile: [GRO] Mobile: [GRO]  
External Email: [GRO]  
Michele Graves

Michele Graves  
18/06/2010 11:22

To: Lin Norbury/e/POSTOFFICE [GRO]  
cc: Eunice Kirby/e/POSTOFFICE [GRO]  
Sarah Howard/e/POSTOFFICE [GRO]  
Subject: re reply to Mrs Stubbs - Barkham PO

Hi Lin

Following our conversation I have prepared the attached draft. See what you think, make any changes and then I will send it out in my name.

Moving forward, can you confirm what your next steps are re the points she has raised. I know you are waiting for the audit trail of the transaction events. Re the comment about the two auditor visits monitoring her work and apparently also having a problem with the figures, are you obtaining a report from the auditor? If this escalates we will need to answer the apparent discrepancies in the figures on his laptop & Horizon.

Finally, when your investigations into the issues she has raised have been completed, will one of your team be writing to Mrs Stubbs or do you want to channel through me? If it comes from your team, can they make reference to the letter to David & that this is the result of investigations into the issues she raised with him. Please advise.

Thanks !

Michele Graves  
**Executive Correspondence Manager**  
**Executive Correspondence Team**  
Post Office Limited

---

1st Floor, Bunhill Row Wing, 148 Old Street, LONDON, EC1V 9HQ

phone number **GRO** Postline: **GRO** 2  
mobile number **GRO**  
fax **GRO**

---

**Confidential Information:**

*This email message is for the sole use of the intended recipient(s) and may contain confidential and privileged information. Any unauthorised review, use, disclosure or distribution is prohibited. If you are not the intended recipient please contact me by reply email and destroy all copies of the original message.*

>>>> ECT 090-10 Stubbs - Barkham - draft.doc attachment was removed from this email <<<<  
>>>> ECT 090-10 - Stubbs - Barkham -draft.doc attachment was removed from this email <<<<



