

Message

From: Rodric Williams [GRO]
Sent: 29/11/2016 14:26:56
To: Shirley Hailstones [GRO]; Parsons, Andrew [/o=Exchange-Org/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=ad9ed344815e47e4aaa3c0e7e1740919-Andrew Pars]; Angela Van-Den-Bogerd [GRO]; FOITEAM [GRO]
Subject: RE: Legally Privileged - Further Enquiry on Horizon Errors from Anobody [BD-4A.FID26896945]

Hi – that looks good to me thank you both.

Just one small typo in the last sentence of the first bullet point (“*Event logs can also be produced which will provide detail on who ~~done~~ did what and at what time*”).

Other than that, as far as I’m concerned this can go onto PO letterhead and sent by Angela.

Kind regards, Rod

From: Shirley Hailstones
Sent: 29 November 2016 10:51
To: Parsons, Andrew; Angela Van-Den-Bogerd; Rodric Williams; FOITEAM
Subject: RE: Legally Privileged - Further Enquiry on Horizon Errors from Anobody [BD-4A.FID26896945]

Hi Andy

Please see my additions: I’ve tracked changes.

S



Shirley Hailstones

Support Services Resolution Manager

Post Office Limited
Guildhall, 57 Queen St
Glasgow
G1 3AT

Tel: [GRO]

Email: [GRO]

Confidential Information:

This email message is for the sole use of the intended recipient(s) and may contain confidential and privileged information. Any unauthorised review, use, disclosure or distribution is prohibited.

If you are not the intended recipient please contact me by reply email and destroy all copies of the original message.

From: Parsons, Andrew [mailto:[GRO]]
Sent: 25 November 2016 18:18
To: Angela Van-Den-Bogerd; Rodric Williams; FOITEAM; Shirley Hailstones
Subject: RE: Legally Privileged - Further Enquiry on Horizon Errors from Anobody [BD-4A.FID26896945]

Angela

Please find attached a draft response to Mr Obody that Rod has already seen and commented on. Picking up a point in one of the emails below, we’ve left space in the response to insert some guidance from Shirley on how to investigate shortfalls.

Shirley – would you mind adding a few bullets to the draft response and then re-circulating?

Thanks
Andy

Andrew Parsons
Partner
Bond Dickinson LLP

Bond Dickinson

Direct: **GRO**
Mobile:
Office: **GRO**
Follow Bond Dickinson:



www.bonddickinson.com

From: Angela Van-Den-Bogerd [mailto:] **GRO**
Sent: 24 November 2016 16:21
To: Rodric Williams; FOITEAM; Parsons, Andrew
Subject: RE: Legally Privileged - Further Enquiry on Horizon Errors from Anobody

Kerry

This is the latest on this.

Andy – I've not seen a draft response on this as requested by Rod. When do you anticipate I will?

Thanks,
Angela



Angela Van Den Bogerd
Director of Support Services

1st Floor, Ty Brwydran,
Atlantic Close, Llansamlet
Swansea SA7 9FJ

M: **GRO**
L:

Confidential Information:

This email message is for the sole use of the intended recipient(s) and may contain confidential and privileged information. Any unauthorised review, use, disclosure or distribution is prohibited. If you are not the intended recipient please contact me by reply email and destroy all copies of the original message.

From: Angela Van-Den-Bogerd
Sent: 16 November 2016 23:05
To: Rodric Williams <] **GRO** >
Cc: FOITEAM <] **GRO** >; Parsons, Andrew <] **GRO** >
Subject: RE: Legally Privileged - Further Enquiry on Horizon Errors from Anobody

Thanks Rod,

I await the draft from Andy.

Kerry – would you amend the FOI response as per Rod's suggestion please.

Thanks,
Angela



Angela Van Den Bogerd
Director of Support Services

1st Floor, Ty Brwydran,
Atlantic Close, Llansamlet
Swansea SA7 9FJ

M: GRO
L: GRO

Confidential Information:

This email message is for the sole use of the intended recipient(s) and may contain confidential and privileged information. Any unauthorised review, use, disclosure or distribution is prohibited. If you are not the intended recipient please contact me by reply email and destroy all copies of the original message.

From: Rodric Williams

Sent: 16 November 2016 19:16

To: Angela Van-Den-Bogerd <GRO>

Cc: FOITEAM <GRO>; Parsons, Andrew <GRO>

Subject: RE: Legally Privileged - Further Enquiry on Horizon Errors from Anobody

Hi Angela – I do not think this is a genuine request. It has all the hallmarks of Tim McCormack mischief, and indeed these FOIA requests were recently cited in a blog which thanked Mr McCormack “for his work and help in relation to the Horizon system”.

Nevertheless, we need to respond prudently, which I think we can do as follows:

1. I would use the FOIA response as drafted, concluding the letter as follows:

We deal with requests that do not fall under the FOIA through standard business enquiry processes rather than as a formal request for information, ~~therefore in answer to your question, (insert BAU answer).~~ You will therefore receive a response from the relevant Post Office business unit directly.

2. In terms of the BAU response, the point we want to get across is that asking for the Known Error Log to try to identify whether anything in it impacted a branch's accounts is to put the cart before the horse.

The KEL is a substantial electronic record, very little of which will have any bearing on an individual branch's accounts, and none of which (Fujitsu tells us) has ever affected the Core Audit Log, i.e. the record of transactions as entered by the branch.

The PMR however is in the branch looking at his accounts all the time, and even if he can't tell precisely what has gone wrong (though Kath and Shirley's guidance will help), he must at least know when things started to go awry.

Without even that most basic of information from the PMR, asking for the KEL is a bit like asking Sainsbury's for a list of all prices ever charged for all products to work out why he's spent more on his weekly shop, when really he should start by looking at what he's put in his basket.

Given that that is not the greatest analogy, but more importantly how central this allocation and sequencing of responsibility for branch account anomalies is in the Freeths litigation (where we should assume this will end up), I have asked Bond Dickinson (Andy Parsons cc'ed) to draft something setting this out, which we can then dovetail with Kath and Shirley's guidance for them to send.

3. On the false accounting point, it is in PMR's interest (and arguably also his duty) to raise with us anomalies in his branch accounts. If he has instead acted in a way which he is concerned gives rise to criminal liability, he should seek independent legal advice.

I hope that helps. Please let me know if you would like to discuss.
Kind regards, Rod

From: Angela Van-Den-Bogerd
Sent: 14 November 2016 20:13
To: Rodric Williams
Cc: FOITEAM
Subject: FW: Legally Privileged - Further Enquiry on Horizon Errors from Anobody
Importance: High

Rodric,

Could you respond to me email of 3rd November so that we can formally respond to the follow up request from this postmaster.

Thanks,
Angela



Angela Van Den Bogerd
Director of Support Services

1st Floor, Ty Brwydran,
Atlantic Close, Llansamlet
Swansea SA7 9FJ

M: GRO
L:

Confidential Information:

This email message is for the sole use of the intended recipient(s) and may contain confidential and privileged information. Any unauthorised review, use, disclosure or distribution is prohibited. If you are not the intended recipient please contact me by reply email and destroy all copies of the original message.

From: FOITEAM
Sent: 14 November 2016 17:33
To: Angela Van-Den-Bogerd <GRO>
Subject: FW: Legally Privileged - Further Enquiry on Horizon Errors from Anobody
Importance: High

Hi Angela,

Do you have the response ready you were working on in relation to this request?

Many thanks,



Kerry Moodie
Information Rights Manager

1st Floor
Finsbury Dials
20 Finsbury Street
London EC2Y 9AQ

GRO

From: Angela Van-Den-Bogerd
Sent: 03 November 2016 08:30
To: Rodric Williams; Patrick Bourke; Melanie Corfield; Mark R Davies
Cc: FOITEAM
Subject: Legally Privileged - Further Enquiry on Horizon Errors from Anobody
Importance: High

Rod,

This postmaster clearly thinks that the answer to their problem is in this list of errors and in all likelihood is therefore not looking/or does not know how to look for any discrepancies in branch. I really want to try and help this postmaster but clearly we cannot say that we will not address what they have confirmed to us ie that they have falsified their account.

My preference would be to explain to this postmaster what the errors to which he refers are and that if these were affecting his branch we would be able to identify that. And as per my request to Shirley below offer some guidance on how to look for discrepancies and accounting irregularities and importantly how to control the balancing of their branch.

On the false accounting point could we say something along the lines of "each case is treated on its merit and therefore we could not say until we were aware of the facts of the situation what action if any would be taken contractually or legally. But it could be possible that an error or errors within the branch could have contributed to any loss and there is a possibility that with proper scrutiny of the Horizon data we could establish what had happened in branch"

What's your view?

Patrick, Mel, Mark – any thoughts welcome.

Thanks,
Angela



Angela Van Den Bogerd
Director of Support Services

1st Floor, Ty Brwydran,
Atlantic Close, Llansamlet
Swansea SA7 9FJ

M: **GRO**

L: GRO

Confidential Information:

This email message is for the sole use of the intended recipient(s) and may contain confidential and privileged information. Any unauthorised review, use, disclosure or distribution is prohibited. If you are not the intended recipient please contact me by reply email and destroy all copies of the original message.

From: Angela Van-Den-Bogerd**Sent:** 03 November 2016 08:07**To:** Shirley Hailstones <GRO>**Subject:** FW: Further Enquiry on Horizon Errors from Anobody**Importance:** High

Shirley

Would you pull some pointers together for me to send to this postmaster. I have no idea what the size of this loss is or over what period it has built up but in the absence of them talking to us I want to offer some guidance on how to look for discrepancies and perhaps staff theft/manipulation of transactions. Also guidance on how to run a tight ship eg accurate cash declarations; weekly balancing etc. I know you'll get my drift.

Could you do this today please as this postmaster is sounding desperate and making references to taking their own life.

Thanks,
Angela



Angela Van Den Bogerd
Director of Support Services

1st Floor, Ty Brwydran,
Atlantic Close, Llansamlet
Swansea SA7 9FJ

M:
L: GRO**Confidential Information:**

This email message is for the sole use of the intended recipient(s) and may contain confidential and privileged information. Any unauthorised review, use, disclosure or distribution is prohibited. If you are not the intended recipient please contact me by reply email and destroy all copies of the original message.

From: FOITEAM**Sent:** 01 November 2016 11:01

To: Angela Van-Den-Bogerd <GRO>; Melanie Corfield
<GRO>; Mark R Davies <GRO>; Patrick Bourke
<GRO>; Rodric Williams <GRO>

Subject: Further Enquiry on Horizon Errors from Anobody**Importance:** High

Good Morning All,

Please see the reply received from Mr Obody below.

In light of the Court Action I think legal should draft the response to this, we have provided the 'anonymous' person options to resolve the alleged issue pursue and cannot do much else in this public arena and advised what they should do if they want an internal review.

I think the response should be based on the fact that this is not a request for recorded information and whatever context are felt to be required – therefore I have attached the basic response to this for amendment.

I will acknowledge the request and await further instructions.

Regards,



Kerry Moodie
Information Rights Manager

1st Floor
Finsbury Dials
20 Finsbury Street
London EC2Y 9AQ

GRO

Dear Post Office Limited,

I thought i sent a reply to you but it doesn't seem to have got through.

I cannot talk to anyone about this because I have signed off my branch accounts with the wrong figures and I can go to prison for doing that. I haven't taken any money. I want to know what errors to look for. I read all this talk about errors in horizon on the internet I want to know what they are. YOu say you have that information but you won't give me it so what is my alternative. I don't have that sort of money to give to you. Will you prosecute me for my accounts if I talk to mrs Bogard? Please tell me, surely you have to tell me what these errors are?

Yours faithfully,

A.N. Obody

Please use this email address for all replies to this request:

request-368411-1ddf6d3c[**GRO**]

Is foia[**GRO**] the wrong address for Freedom of Information requests to Post Office Limited? If so, please contact us using this form:

https://www.whatdotheyknow.com/change_request/new?body=post_office

Disclaimer: This message and any reply that you make will be published on the internet. Our privacy and copyright policies:

<https://www.whatdotheyknow.com/help/officers>

For more detailed guidance on safely disclosing information, read the latest advice from the ICO:

<https://www.whatdotheyknow.com/help/ico-guidance-for-authorities>

If you find this service useful as an FOI officer, please ask your web manager to link to us from your organisation's FOI page.

This email and any attachments are confidential and intended for the addressee only. If you are not the named recipient, you must not use, disclose, reproduce, copy or distribute the contents of this communication. If you have received this in error, please contact the sender by reply email and then delete this email from your system. Any views or opinions expressed within this email are solely those of the sender, unless otherwise specifically stated.

POST OFFICE LIMITED is registered in England and Wales no 2154540. Registered Office: Finsbury Dials, 20 Finsbury Street, London EC2Y 9AQ.

Please consider the environment! Do you need to print this email?

The information in this e-mail and any attachments is confidential and may be legally privileged and protected by law. shirley.hailstones **GRO** is authorised to access this e-mail and any attachments. If you are not shirley.hailstones **GRO** please notify andrew.parsons **GRO** as soon as possible and delete any copies. Unauthorised use, dissemination, distribution, publication or copying of this communication or attachments is prohibited and may be unlawful.

Any files attached to this e-mail will have been checked by us with virus detection software before transmission. Bond Dickinson LLP accepts no liability for any loss or damage which may be caused by software viruses and you should carry out your own virus checks before opening any attachment.

Content of this email which does not relate to the official business of Bond Dickinson LLP, is neither given nor endorsed by it.

This email is sent by Bond Dickinson LLP which is a limited liability partnership registered in England and Wales under number OC317661. Our registered office is 4 More London Riverside, London, SE1 2AU, where a list of members' names is open to inspection. We use the term partner to refer to a member of the LLP, or an employee or consultant who is of equivalent standing. Our VAT registration number is GB123393627.

Bond Dickinson LLP is authorised and regulated by the Solicitors Regulation Authority.