

Summary Info

Ref: g:\gij documents\poa\prosecution support\summary info.docx

Author: Gareth I Jenkins

Date: 07/01/2013 16:18:00

1. Introduction

James Davidson has asked me to put together an Executive Level briefing pack of about 3 slides re Prosecutions relating to Horizon.

The purpose of this note is to pull together all the relevant info and organise it so that I can then generate the required summary.

2. Past Cases

The following lists cases where I have provided evidence and the integrity of Horizon has been challenged:

There have been a couple of other cases where I have provided evidence re horizon, but these were police requests to support other crimes, in one case a murder alibi and another related to drug money laundering.

- Gaerwen: Defendant was Noel Thomas who is prominent in the group complaining re Horizon issues. I was due to go to court in September 2006, but was advised that a deal had been done at the last minute and so didn't need to appear.
- Marine Drive: This was where Lee Castleton prosecuted POL for wrongful dismissal in a civil case and lost. Case was late 2006. I was involved in analysing evidence, but POL used an independent expert and Anne Chambers (SSC) appeared as a witness.
- Donnington: The issue here related to dual Log On. I prepared a statement and went to court in Shrewsbury in Jan 2007. Defendant pleaded at last minute so no court appearance required.
- Porter's Avenue: Defendant was Hosi. I commented on a Defence Expert's Report and analysed a few months worth of data. I also attended a pre-trial hearing in May 2010. Trial was in November 2010, but I was not required. (Steve Evans provided evidence re base build of Horizon terminal.)
- West Byfleet: Defendant was Misra. I provided a number of statements on this during 2010 including detailed comments on the Defence expert's report and also did a detailed analysis of 1 year's worth of transactions. I was present at the trial in October 2010 and spent a full day in the Witness box under examination and cross-examination.
- Bramwell: Defendant was Humphrey. The issue here was the amount of theft. Defendant pleaded guilty to Theft, but challenged the amount. I did an analysis of the evidence and spent 2 days in court (Norwich) listening to evidence.

FUJITSU RESTRICTED (COMMERCIAL IN CONFIDENCE)

Although not called, I was able to instruct the barrister as to the flaw in the defendant's argument and the case collapsed and he pleaded guilty to the full amount.

- Rinkfield: Defendant was McQue. Again I did an analysis of a year's worth of transactions and provided detailed comments on the defence expert's report and had a couple of meetings with the defence expert to try and produce an agreed report. The Defence expert was the same as for the Misra case and his report was almost identical (initial draft just had the name of the defendant changed!) I went to Court (Carlisle), but after various discussions, pre-trial the defendant agreed to plead guilty and Theft charge dropped by POL.
- Bishop's Hull: Defendant is Bramwell (not to be confused with Bramwell PO above!). I read a defence expert's report and basically agreed with its conclusions. I also passed across info on Horizon integrity. No actual report was required and I don't think this case has come to court yet.

3. Current Cases

There are currently 7 cases where I have been asked to provide a statement re the integrity of Horizon. These are summarised in a separate spreadsheet.

So far I have produced 4 statements (which are broadly similar with just one or two paras relating to the specific case and the rest – around 11 pages – generic). I will probably handle the other 3 in a similar way.

One (Grant Allen) is of specific interest as it is claimed that £3,000 of the overall loss was due to issues when relocating the branch in March 2010. I have been asked by Fujitsu (but not POL) to investigate this further and will do so.

4. POL Independent Investigation

Due to pressure from various MPs, Post Office Ltd have agreed to carry out an independent investigation into a number of disputed past cases (mainly Horizon rather than HNG-X) and have engaged a 3rd party (Second Sight) to carry out this investigation.

In September 2012 I ran a workshop with Ian Henderson (Advanced Forensics – presumably working for Second Sight) where I presented sample audit data from both Horizon and HNG-X explaining what is held and what can be found from the data.

I had provided similar support to defence Expert Witnesses in their analysis of data – particularly for the West Byfleet and Rinkfield cases.

I understand that data from about 8 branches has been given to Second Sight, but I have had no requests for any follow up explanations.

5. Email Summary

I have gone back through old emails to May 2005 looking for anything relating to Prosecution support.

There are a number of instances where I have provided answers to technical questions that have been asked by POL's litigation support team of our support team. These are often informal requests, but in some cases result in the response being re-submitted as a Witness Statement.

List of relevant emails:

1. Z Pathway Other History May 05 to March 06
 - a. 1/9/05: Statement request & a question? Info on User creation
 - b. 8/9/05: R. vs. Teja - Can you help? Info re OBCS processing for DWP
 - c. 21/9/05 – 7/12/05: OBCS Replacement Update to Standard witness statement re Network Banking
 - d. 19/10/05: Some queries .. Clarification re questions raised in court to support Penny
 - e. 9/11/05 – 28/11/05: WS for Rvs Teja working on a Witness statement from me describing Horizon workings
 - f. 7/12/05: Marine Drive - Security Confidential This relates to the Lee Castleton case mentioned by CW.
 - g. 19/1/06: Statement Queries re Postage Labels
 - h. 24/1/06: Descriptions Queries re Log Out traces
 - i. 30/1/06: Witness Statement - With Label Detail helping Penny with Label info (probably related to g above)
 - j. 9/2/06: Statement please Queries re Users who are inactive for a period.
 - k. 22/2/06: Horizon Query Queries re Cash Declarations
 - l. 1/3/06: Fujitsu Queries re Engineer visits
 - m. 6/3/06: Court Case – Urgent Request for info re Software upgrades
 - n. 21/3/06 – 30/3/06: Fujitsu Statements Gaerwen Relates to case of Noel Evans in CW
2. YYY Pathway History April 06 to October 06
 - a. Brian Pinder
 - i. 5/6/06 to 6/11/06: Various exchanges re Lee Castleton / Marine Drive
 - ii. 11/9/06: Gaerwen
 - b. Penny Thomas
 - i. Various queries

FUJITSU RESTRICTED (COMMERCIAL IN CONFIDENCE)

- ii.11/9/06: Donnington Witness statement produced re Donnington case (explaining dual Log On)
 - c. Peter Sewell
 - Exchanges re above cases.
- 3. YY Pathway History October 06 to June 07
 - a. Brian Pinder
 - i. 1/11/06 – 23/11/06 More exchanges re Lee Castelton
 - ii.29/6/07: Porters Avenue (Branch Code - 107026) Initial request re this.
 - b. Penny Thomas
 - i. 8/11/06: More info re Lee Castleton
 - ii.22/11/06: Heellppp !! Analysis of why a Log Out didn't occur
 - iii. 4/12/06: Can you (or someone) explain READ THIS ONE FIRST PLEASE !!!! Value of missing cheques
 - iv. 11/12/06: Assistance How to reprint a BTS
 - v.31/1/07: Gullane PO, Branch Code 195 824 Question re remote Log On
 - vi. 12/3/07: Donnington Info re sentencing (Case was 29/1/07 in Shrewsbury)
 - vii. And other queries
 - c. Peter Sewell
 - Exchanges re above cases.
- 4. Y Pathway History July 07 to Jan 08
 - a. Penny Thomas
 - i. Various queries
- 5. XX Pathway History Feb 08 to June 08
 - a. Penny Thomas
 - i. Various queries
 - b. Peter Sewell
 - i. 30/4/08: Time Handling on Horizon Statement re time handling which enabled police to quash an alibi for a nasty murder. (He got 30 years – I remember seeing it in the paper!)
- 6. X Pathway History July 08 to Nov 08
 - a. Penny Thomas
 - i. 11/8/08: No title Draft Witness statement re BTS Extract tool for Cowleymoore

FUJITSU RESTRICTED (COMMERCIAL IN CONFIDENCE)

- ii. Various queries
- 7. WWW Pathway History Dec 2008 to May 2009
 - a. Penny Thomas
 - i. 22/5/09: Analysis for Rivenahall and Feering Analysis of Cheque handling in two branches
 - ii. Various queries
 - b. Peter Sewell
 - i. 10/12/08: R-V-NARENTHIRAN Help provided in analysing Logs to a Defence expert who immediately spotted why client was guilty!
- 8. WW Pathway History November 2009 to Feb 2010
 - a. Penny Thomas
 - i. 7/12/09: Misra - West Byfleet PO First mention of this case
 - ii. 18/1/10: Shoeburyness and Leigh on Sea Refers to Hosi case which was Porter's Avenue.
 - iii. 19/1/10: Activation Codes Providing a statement re use of Mobile Top ups
 - iv. 26/1/10: Transactions Analysis of Postal Services labels in a branch
- 9.

6. Current Cases

7. POL Independent Investigation

8. Email Summary