

①

13th Sept '04 @ Dungannon. Judge McFarland.

R-v- Maureen McKelvey. 47/04.

11.20. Jury members being called.

|                       |                       |                       |                       |                             |                             |
|-----------------------|-----------------------|-----------------------|-----------------------|-----------------------------|-----------------------------|
| ⊙<br>168 <sub>F</sub> | ⊙<br>186 <sub>F</sub> | ⊙<br>183 <sub>M</sub> | ✓<br>170 <sub>F</sub> | ✓<br>182 <sub>F</sub>       | ✓<br>181 <sub>M</sub> ?     |
| ⊙<br>217 <sub>F</sub> | ⊙<br>230 <sub>F</sub> | ⊙<br>219 <sub>F</sub> | ✓<br>209 <sub>M</sub> | ✓<br>139 <sub>M</sub>       | ✓<br>132 <sub>M</sub>       |
| ⊙<br>203 <sub>F</sub> | ✓<br>211 <sub>M</sub> | ⊙<br>127 <sub>M</sub> | ✓<br>139 <sub>F</sub> | ⊙<br>220 <sub>M</sub>       | ✓<br>152 <sub>M</sub>       |
| ✓<br>167 <sub>F</sub> | ✓<br>129 <sub>M</sub> | ✓<br>131 <sub>M</sub> | 197 <sub>M</sub>      | 221 <sub>F</sub><br>excused | 215 <sub>F</sub>            |
| 248 <sub>M</sub>      | 195 <sub>F</sub>      | 241 <sub>F</sub>      | 242 <sub>F</sub>      | 133 <sub>M</sub>            | 201 <sub>F</sub><br>excused |
| 233 <sub>M</sub>      | 243 <sub>M</sub>      |                       |                       |                             |                             |

12.25pm Jury brought back and put in charge.  
 Trial to begin at 1.50pm.

2.23pm Judge returned.  
 Exhibits agreed. & a number of witnesses agreed.

Mr McKay BL For Crown.  
 Mr Berry BL For Defence.

(2)

Crown opened at 2.29 pm. to jury.

Read and explained indictment.

Obligation on prosecution to prove guilt.

No obligation on defence to prove innocence. Defendant has right to remain silent.

Reasonable doubt - you must feel sure of a person's guilt before you find her guilty. You must be sure that she is guilty of theft of £4000 from

Post Office Ltd. Defined as dishonest gain of property. Taking of money belonging to another person. You'll hear evidence from employee's by staff from Post Office. Benefits paid by Post Office.

Post office used as means of distributing benefits. Pension Book, Allowance Book, detachable foils, printed date of payment, amount & National Insurance Number.

Book handed to post mistress & a sum of money handed out. Log foil as proof of amount of money paid out. In this case the lady charged is an

agent of the P.O. Runs garage & mini market attached to P.O. in Clonabogan, outskirts of

Omagh on road to Dromore. She would be required to make summary of money paid out - Required to keep a tally daily or at least once per week.

Post mistress has to account to hisahally Order Unit for pensions. System put in place so as P.O can keep control over money paid and passed through P.O. Roba check dispatched. 19 Sept to

31 Oct '01 & found discrepancies by adding up foils - an imbalance between 40p in one account to £148p in total. Discrepancies trigger off investigation to find out what is causing it. Arranged to interview this lady. Leslie Thorpe & Suzanne Winter went to P.O run by accused & carried out a

③

special audit in company of Mr McKinney on 4/4/02. As result of audit confirmed discrepancies. When they interviewed accused that day & she was unable to explain how they came about. After interview was over informed P.O would carry out a check for over claims. On 2/5/02 further contact between Postal Unit & solicitor. Interviewed again on 27/5/02 Summary of various overclaims & discrepancies. All figures added up came to over £4,000. She did not accept that she was guilty. Did not give any explanation for discrepancies. Ingredients of crime will be made out very clearly to you. This is a very straightforward case but because involves a large number of documents becomes complicated. This is not a case of just a mistake as you will see the numbers of discrepancies. Deliberate & premeditated.

2.47pm Una Kelly called:

Employed by SSA known as paid order unit in Londonderry. Admin Assistant who examines paid order foils. Specific unit to check this. Checking? Paid orders forms that have been ~~the~~ paid that wk. P.O mistress does tally of listings & we check against this.

Do u recall checking for Clonabogan P.O.? Yes checked for wk no. 26 - goes in numerical order. Pick a different P.O. to check each week. Handed copy of Exhibit 7 to Miss Kelly. Shown on screen.

This doc comes from P.O. keyed in by computer. Handwriting on this doc by Miss Kelly because figures have been changed because of discrepancies.

(4)

On order which says 2 listings for £89.41 where in fact there should only have been one.

Did you find other discrepancies? Yes.

Under Gp 7 2 orders @ £148 each & one order received. Listing is inaccurate.

Is Gp 7 different types of benefits - Yes - all numbers are different types of benefit.

Under Gp 13 2 orders of £89.41 & only one received.

In relation to each then disallowed these sums.

When confirmed groups disallowed - made a note that these sums not received - adjust figures accordingly.

In Gp B changed 2 to a 1 £1930.62 - £1849.21.

Overclaim in relation to that was £536.31.

These documents then passed to Bernadette Mellon.

Judge confirmed this is called a Listings Form.

Clanabogan creates this document & it arrives by courier with foils. She prepares a list of everything she has paid out & sends with counterfoils.

Exhibit 7 passed around jury members.

Included with that doc would be foils themselves.

Foils shown to witness to confirm that they are the foils. Individual foils. Within exhibit 7 foils & listings? Yes.

Foils shown to Judge, Mr Bery & then jury.

Witness handed Form 205 - Didn't recognise.

Examined a B Docket. - Didn't require that document to carry out your checking. - Passed info on to A.O. Bernadette Mellon.

Defence:

Confirmed Post mistress sending in listing & foils - If listings or foils not there you cannot carry out your check. B Docket is something you can do without to complete your check. It's better if

5

it is completed. If you were busy in a P.O. & hadn't time to do it, it would be something you would be tempted not to do.

Michael Scarlett called:-

Employed also by SSA - paid order unit - yes at the time but now moved on. At the time responsible for checking paid orders - checked again totals claimed by Post Mistress. Whenever you find such discrepancies wrote on sheet. Then pass these details on to Glenn McDonald A.O. Number of claims made by Clonabogan P.O. Shown exhibit 8. I would check through all the rolls & listings & make sure they all tallied up.

Judge asked where this document came from - who created it? witness didn't know. Judge asked what was this called? Another listings - Pensions & Allowances.

Is this your handwriting? Yes. 26/1/01 examined. Why did you change figures? Because when I checked it I found discrepancies. In listings page 2 & 2 discrepancies in Gp 13 & an error in Gp 5. These were only discrepancies in relation to that week (3).

Looked at Exhibit 9,

B Docket which I made up myself because Post Mistress didn't send one. Looking @ Ex 9 & allowances paid out did you find any discrepancies.

Ex 10 - one discrepancy in Gp 13. £55.30 - claimed but not received.

Did you examine any other of the exhibits? Yes I did 4 weeks.

Exhibit 11 shown to witness.

⑥

Completed summary referred to a B docket.  
one discrepancy in wk 30 - £55 claimed but disallowed. - no other discrepancies.  
4 consecutive weeks checked & that was the discrepancies found.

Defence:

Asked Exhibit 8 be shown - page 59.  
Ret pension / A11 - column JB 74 - did you score that out - yes. next column ~~5246.02~~ - 5259.55  
What is effect of that? That is me correcting the error. She hasn't claimed for something and you are allowing her something rather than disallowing.  
Milk Taken P & A you have adjusted figure accordingly. How much extra have you given her?  
£45.53. The next week you are going through and she is 1p out.

Crown: These additional figure - wk 39 allowed for 18p & 40p disallowed. What should figure be £43.13.

Judge: In wk 27 she under claimed - In wk 28 1penny & wk 29 - one foil.

Bernadette Mellon called: -

Employed by SSA - AO - Lisahally Paid Order Unit.  
Required to check work of Admin Assistants. Checked by taking each bundles of paid orders - initial changes made. Did you check claims made by Clonabogain. Did you find the same discrepancies as Una Kelly. Yes.

Defence: No questions

(7)

Glenn McDonald called.  
Employed by SSA as A.O. in Lisahally Unit.  
Form 205A in respect of discrepancies. Yes.  
What is 205A? A computer printout of discrepancies in this case for 5 weeks.  
Page 72 of exhibits - shown to jury.  
This is a summary of all errors found in week of 19/9/01. 2 errors in Gp 7, 2 in Gp 13, 3 in Gp 5  
All discrepancies totalled £506.31. I received weekly listings P23 - I take all the errors of that and put them on a computer printout. Check that discrepancies are correct. Printed out on this form 205A - 3 copies & put on file and give to an Executive Officer II - This is a checking system. Sent up to Post Office Network Security - Yes correct. Signed identification labels separately.

Defence: No questions.

Judge clarified terms of form 205A for jury.

Susan Hanna called:-

Employed by SSA as EOII in Lisahally.  
Supervised staff who examined documents. Looked at Exhibit 12. Did you receive that document from Glenn McDonald? Yes. checked? Yes.  
Figures were accurate? yes. Return file & contents to A.O. Signed identification labels.  
The role you play is a supervisory role to make sure no-one has made mistakes further down the line.

Defence: When material comes in from P.O goes to

⑧

A.A. & then to an A.O. and then you are the triple check. Yes. If A.A. missed something the next man should pick it up? Yes.

John McKenny called & sent back.

Kenneth Sharpe called:-

Were you employed as Agency Contract Manager. Responsibilities with that Dept? Advise P.O. about contracts - advise other managers & Business Units.

Are Sub PO's employed by P.O. - No self-employed and act as agents. Did you know about this P.O. A sub office - this lady not an employee of P.O. Under terms of contract P.O. is responsibility - Her shop is nothing to do with P.O. She can do the PO herself or employ someone to do it.

Did she let sign on as Sub Post mistress? Yes on 15/7/90. She remained in that position until 2002. It was suspended when found out about overclaims.

Defence: If any money goes missing Post mistress is responsible. The P.O. will come after her for the money because she is bound for that money. Yes she is liable.

Judge: When you talk about money missing - the PO sends her that money through Courier & she then pays it out on benefits.

Crown: I assume contract is one that doesn't need seen by jury.

Robert George Wallace called:-

Employed in Oct '02 by Consignia - as a security

(9)

manager. On 2 May did you go along with Suzanne Winter to Clanabogan P.O. to examine pensions. Examination took place in Royal Mail House in Belfast. Mrs McKevey and her sister was present. The wks you examined in her presence were (5 wks chosen at random). You gave her the choice of which 5 wks to examine & these are the ones she chose. Discrepancies were found for 2 of these weeks. Referred witness to exhibits 23 & 24.

Asked witness did he recognise Ex 23 - I didn't actually summarize this document - it was summarized by Suzanne Winter. Whenever I find discrepancies I passed them to Suzanne Winter.

Witness shown week 34.

3 mistakes this week.

Defence: - No questions

Broke up for today, @ 4.30pm.

Exhibit 49 - Judge requested 6 copies for jury.

Tuesday 14th Sept '04.

Mr. McKenny called:-

confirmed employment. Auditor. - visited various P.O. On 4 April attended along with other witnesses to carry out an audit. Arrived @ 8.40am.

Mrs McKevey informed of purpose of visit - Requested that she hand over all stock, cash stock & other paid vouchers. Audit carried out was from last time Mrs McKevey balanced her books - Exhibit 22 shown to jury. Mr McKenny explained this document.

⑩

Defence:

Your job within Consignia? Do u go around & conduct audits & if things are not going well you would say you want to improve in certain areas. Yes. Have you been to Clanabogan before? Yes. You were there in April 2001. Yes. How many times have u been to Clanabogan? I have 3 visits starting in 1998 in this file including this audit. In April 2001 you prepare a report & looked @ controls in place - High & low risk. -yes. Have you got documents from April 2001? Yes. Shown form & asked if he recognized it? Yes. You did 1st of all an acid verification. We look @ her safe accommodation - ensure her alarm system is working.

Sub post masters are responsible for all discrepancies

Mr. Kennedy called: -

Worked for PO for 16 years.

What does system record? Sales, payments & receipts.

Does Post mistress have means of getting access to that system? Yes. access code after training. She would have a unique users account password.

What kind of system account for action? A basic accounting system records all transactions going through. Does accounting week start on Thurs? Yes usually - except bank holiday as premises wouldn't be open. Transactions carried out at Clanabogan.

Exhibit 7/8 shown to witness.

Asked to explain B Docket.

She can get an instance view @ any time of day any mistakes made. - Snapshot - like taking a photo - would give a summary & breakdown of all cash receipts. If any discrepancy it would be apparent to

(11)

anyone using system. Yes. Cash accounts shows summary - signed by post mistress copies of cash amount. She keeps one copy & send copy to Chesterfield - Head accounting Dept. Pension allowance are given to customers in receipt of benefits.

If OTSS wish to recall a relevant book they would call for it to staff at RD. Covers of benefit books shows identity of customers. - a lot of detail on these books. Every single transaction goes through P.O. quicker than using the screen. This woman could access system @ any time to produce a summary. Is there any discrepancies in the system. - Yes a button to press to confirm correct or not. Option to go back & change any error found. If there were errors to reflect does system cut off at some stage.

In relation to system are staff trained? Initially before this came out Post masters had to attend course & when completed certificate would be issued.

When did system change from manual to computerized. Around 1999. This woman would have done this manually prior to this? Yes. If difficulty with her capacity in using machine is there anything you can help her? There is a helpdesk which she can ring @ any stage. - Manual with diagrams.

Defence.

The manuals you have described are Horizon user guides? Yes. How many would you get? No idea. If I have a Horizon problem in office how many guides have I got to choose from? Don't know. Several books in each file & there are several files. If you phone helpdesk they will refer you to manual - Not really they can talk you through which buttons

(2)

to press. How long was training? 1 1/2 days in Melon Country Inn. When system was installed someone came out to install it. Is 3 day the norm - yes it would be the norm for support & then someone would come back on Wednesdays. Witness shown page 31 Haven't mentioned in statement of evidence that someone from Horizon there for 3 days. Do you know how long anyone stayed with Mrs McKelvey for? Don't know. It is correct to say that info produced in printout is dependant on what is put in? Yes. If there is an error in input it will be reflected on printout. You have described checks post mistress should be doing. Having done these things they will see that the computer is wrong. Errors will be detected. Yes. In terms of working of sub P.O is there a float? They provide sufficient funds in order to supply the public. Have you heard of situations when the float wasn't big enough. Yes occasionally. Mrs McKelvey would say that habitually the floats weren't big enough & she was having to use her own money. And then when the float would come in she would have to repay herself.

Crown:

The question of P.O being faced with situation where not enough money is there a system in place to cope with that? She could have contacted the P.O to avoid the problem & get more money. Is there a place on computer to log that? I am not aware procedure but there is a system for this on computer

Judge: Do you know how to do that? I have never had to do that. If she phoned you up what

(13)

would you have done? I would have had to contact helpdesk myself. If I phoned up today looking for money tomorrow is that feasible? It would depend on how many vans.

Statement of Sonia Cassidy read to court.

F. Leslie Thorpe called.

Confirmed employment.

Responsible for team of investigators? Yes.

In Jan '02 became aware a number of irregularities in Clancabogan P.D. Allocated case to Suzanne Winter. Went along with S. Winter & M. McKenny to do audit?

Yes. Did u attend interview? Yes. Took place at P. Fahy's office.

Break for lunch.

Suzanne Winter called:-

Started to read interviews.

Defence: Can you say that she got 3 days training. - I have no documentary evidence to say she got 3 day but post masters do get training. Did she not tell you that at Halloween shortage of over £500 & she called Gary Groogan to check. - She provided what she thought was an explanation. - She gave you a number of concerns & spoke to you at length and answered all your questions - she didn't have to stay or answer anything - she was saying to you that this account was in place before she took over this Po. She ran an account for Campbell through the

(14)

shop. She would get a payment into the shop - she was operating a credit facility which she should not do. She raised with you a complaint about this float-cash remittance - every week usually Friday. She said she had been habitually complaining because she was constantly short. A post-master can ring any time & get specials. - She said it wasn't enough & she was requesting float be increased. She was putting money in and taking out. If she <sup>knew</sup> she was going to be short she could ring one day before and the money would be with her quickly. She could go into the post office account and show how much money she was short or had to use. Error on computer - About 7 foils given by Mrs McKelvey - stated she had found within her secure area & bundled together. These foils should have went to Lisahully a year ago. During transcripts you said she had 12 - could have been. You mentioned in evidence that she had taken over P.O in 1990. It was an old building - she bought it with her husband - Her husband died in 1993. She said she had various bits of help. Her son helped - yes in the shop - PO must be kept separate. She didn't during interview say so so would have been in - she wasn't in any way seeking to shift her responsibility. You arrived in April 2002 & she is interviewed. After interview does PO close - no remained open - no-one else brought in to run it. Was she still running it in May. It is fair to say that after 4.4.02 she would have been aware she would have been under close scrutiny. Referred to page 5. more errors. made reference if had been a genuine error.

(15)

Historically check 80,000 foils per week. Not possible for this number to be checked every week.

When was Mrs McKelvey's contract terminated? After 2nd interview. Does she have any Criminal Record? No.

Crown:-

If she had used money from her Supermarket Business she could have paid money from her float - is there a document? Yes there is a document called a Cash Account form she can fill in to say that she had used x amount of money from her Supermarket Business. This is a weekly document.

In all of the 37 discrepancies did you find any entries that she had loaned money to P.O.? No.

Credit Arrangement - if was such arrangement could you account for them.

When you turned up for interview she produced foils which she had found - have these foils anything to do with the weeks we are talking about? No.

Terry Smithson called:-

Employed by P.O Royal Mail. - Field Trainer.

Horizon relatively new system - came into Clonabogan in February 2000. She would have had 1 1/2 days training by Diner of system. If difficulty with training is there anything to alert P.O. She can go to a helpdesk. Went to Clonabogan on 27 Oct 2000 to meet Mr Grogan. He gave me a list of offices to visit with procedural errors. Went to this office & met Mrs McKelvey & offered her training. She said 'No' she would sort out her own errors. If she had expressed training difficulties what

(16)

Q would you have done? I would have stayed around and offered her assistance. keyboard given to witness & confirmed same keyboard now installed in offices. FI4-NI pensions - FI - P&A NI. When find chosen pension you can touch screen to highlight it. keyboard made exhibit 51.

Reference:-

Q When were you asked to give evidence in this case?  
Yesterday. How did you know yesterday why you had to give evidence. I mentioned to Suzanne Winter yesterday that I had been at that office. When did Mr. Griogan speak to you? on 27th Oct. Based @ home. I had no office or sub post master to train. I made myself available for adhoc training. He would only have got that sheet that morning. Stayed 20 mins.

Prosecution case finished.

The image shows a page with a grid of horizontal lines, resembling a table or a form. The grid consists of approximately 25 rows and a single column. On the left side, there are three binder holes. The page is otherwise blank, with no text or data entered into the grid.